Phase 1B Archeological Investigation
Block 457, Lot 28
(Former Methodist Episcopal Cemetery)
New York, New York

PREPARED FOR
Avalon Bay Communities, Inc.
New York, New York

SUBMITTED BY
John Milner Associates, Inc.
Croton-on-Hudson, New York

AUGUST 2005
PHASE 1B ARCHEOLOGICAL INVESTIGATION:
BLOCK 457, LOT 28
(FORMER METHODIST EPISCOPAL CEMETERY)
NEW YORK, NEW YORK

Prepared for

Avalon Bay Communities, Inc.
535 Fifth Avenue, 17th Floor
New York, NY 10017

Submitted by

Patrick J. Heaton, RPA

John Milner Associates, Inc.
1 Croton Point Avenue
Croton-on-Hudson, New York 10520

August 2005
MANAGEMENT SUMMARY

John Milner Associates, Inc. (JMA) conducted an archeological investigation in July 2005 of Block 457, Lot 28 located on the north side of East First Street at Second Avenue in Manhattan. The archeological investigations were conducted on behalf of Avalon Bay Communities, Inc. The proposed development is part of the larger Cooper Square Urban Renewal Plan (CSURP).

Block 457, Lot 28 is the within the former (ca. 1805–1855) location of a Methodist Episcopal Cemetery. Available records indicate that the Trustees of the Methodist Episcopal Church of the City of New York sold the cemetery lot on Block 457 in 1855, and all of the burials were exhumed and re-interred in Cypress Hills Cemetery. Between 1857 and 1862 the former cemetery was subdivided into 13 lots and developed with commercial/residential structures. In 1911 these structures were demolished and replaced with the four-story Kessler Theater (or Second Avenue Theater), which occupied most of the area of the former cemetery. The portions of the former cemetery that were considered to have a potential to contain human remains were two narrow (approximately ten-foot-wide) alleys documented on historic maps that were located along the northern and eastern perimeters of the former theater.

JMA conducted the fieldwork for the Phase 1B investigation within Block 457, Lot 28 between July 13 and July 15, 2005. The fieldwork included the excavation of a nearly continuous trench along the northern and eastern perimeter of the lot. Trench sections ranged from 6 to 10 feet in width. The total length of test trenches was approximately 220 feet. The depth of trench sections ranged from 2 to 12 feet below the existing ground surface.

The archeological investigation documented that the basement of the ca. 1911 Second Avenue Theater exceeded the size of the map-documented footprint of the building. Intact basement wall sections extended to the perimeters of the lot. All portions of the basement documented by JMA were filled with demolition debris, primarily composed of brick rubble. The intact cement floor of the basement was documented in numerous locations at an approximate depth of 12 feet below the existing ground surface. Mid-twentieth-century artifacts (primarily alcohol bottles/fragments) were collected from within the brick rubble from a small area located approximated 20 feet north of East First Street; these materials were collected as a representative sample of the types of refuse included in the demolition debris. The narrow alleys along the north and east perimeters of the former theater were also underlain by basement filled with rubble.

The only portion of the project area that was not characterized by filled basement and demolition debris was a small, 10-foot-by-15-foot area located in the northeast corner of the lot. This area contained fill soils that consisted of mixed ash, cinder, and mortar with late-nineteenth-century artifacts. The artifact-bearing fill stratum was underlain by undisturbed subsoil (sand with gravel and cobbles) at a depth of approximately 6 feet below the existing ground surface. The depth of subsoil observed in this area indicates that the basement of the former Second Avenue Theater (documented at 12 feet bgs in the adjacent trenches) exceeds the depths at which pre-development archeological deposits are likely to be located.

No intact burials, human remains, or other archeologically significant deposits or features were observed or recovered during the course of the Phase 1B investigation. No additional archeological work is recommended in association with the proposed development of Block 457, Lot 28.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Management Summary
List of Figures
List of Photographs

1.0 Introduction........................................................................................................... 1
  1.1 Purpose and Goals of the Investigation ......................................................... 1
  1.2 Project Description and Location .................................................................... 1
  1.3 Project Background ....................................................................................... 1
  1.4 Project Personnel .......................................................................................... 2

2.0 Background Information .................................................................................. 3
  2.1 Historical Background ................................................................................... 3
  2.2 Research Design ........................................................................................... 6

3.0 Research Methods .............................................................................................. 8
  3.1 Archeological Field Methods ......................................................................... 8
  3.2 Laboratory Methods ...................................................................................... 8

4.0 Results and Interpretations ............................................................................... 9
  4.1 Results of Fieldwork .................................................................................... 9
  4.2 Interpretations ............................................................................................... 12

5.0 Conclusions and Recommendations ................................................................ 14
  5.1 Summary and Conclusions .......................................................................... 14
  5.2 Recommendations ....................................................................................... 14

6.0 References Cited ............................................................................................... 15

Figures
Photographs

Appendix A: Artifact Catalog
Appendix B: Faunal Remains

BLOCK 457, LOT 28
(FORMER METHODIST EPISCOPAL CEMETERY)
NEW YORK, NEW YORK
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Detail of the Jersey City, N.J.-N.Y. and Brooklyn, N.Y. (USGS 1981, 1979) 7.5-minute quadrangles showing the location of the Project Area (Block 457, Lot 28).

Figure 2. Map of Block 457 showing historic lot designations and areas of "archaeological potential" (modified from Parsons 2000:Figure 18a).

Figure 3. Detail of the 1852 Dripps Map of the City of New York showing the location of the former Methodist Episcopal Cemetery on Block 457.

Figure 4. Detail of the 1875 Robinson Atlas of the City of New York showing the arrangement of mid-nineteenth-century structures within the Project Area.

Figure 5. Detail of the 1879 Galt & Hoy perspective drawing/bird’s eye map showing the vicinity of the Project Area.

Figure 6. Detail of the 1916 Bromley Atlas of the City of New York showing the Second Avenue Theater and other structures located within the Project Area.

Figure 7. Historic tax-assessment photograph (NYC DOR 1940) depicting the former 4-story commercial structure located at 12 East First Street (Block 457, Historic Lot 44), from East First Street across from the corner of Extra Place.

Figure 8. Historic tax-assessment photograph (NYC DOR 1940) depicting the rear of the former Second Avenue Theatre located on Block 457, Historic Lot 38, from East First Street.

Figure 9. Historic tax-assessment photograph (NYC DOR 1940) depicting the former structures located at 19 Second Avenue (Block 457, Historic Lot 36), from the corner of Second Avenue (right) and East First Street (left).

Figure 10. Detail of the 1947 Sanborn Insurance Maps showing the mid-twentieth-century arrangement of structures within the Project Area.

Figure 11. Site plan depicting the locations of archeological test trenches within Block 457, Lot 28; photographic views are indicated by Photograph Number.

Figure 12. Trench 1, north wall profile, 0–20 feet east from Extra Place.

Figure 13. Trench 2, north wall profile, 0–85 feet east from Extra Place.

Figure 14. Trench 3, east wall profile.
LIST OF PHOTOGRAPHS

Photograph 1. Existing conditions within the Project Area at the time of the Phase 1B investigation; view to the northeast.

Photograph 2. Existing conditions within the Project Area at the time of the Phase 1B investigation; view to the east.

Photograph 3. Excavation of demolition debris and brick rubble in Trench 1; view to the east.

Photograph 4. Demolition debris and fill deposits in the east wall profile of Trench 1; view to the east.

Photograph 5. Brick foundation wall segments and structural beams in Trench 2; view to the east.

Photograph 6. Brick foundation wall segments in Trench 2; view to the west.

Photograph 7. Brick rubble in back-dirt pile during the excavation of Trench 2; view to the northeast.

Photograph 8. Trench 3 at the close of test excavations; view to the west.

Photograph 9. Sample of ceramic sherd recovered from Trench 3, Stratum V (Appendix A: Catalog #2).

Photograph 10. Sample of glass fragments recovered from Trench 3, Stratum V (Appendix A: Catalog #2).

Photograph 11. Demolition debris and brick rubble in Trench 4; view to the northeast.

Photograph 12. Demolition debris and brick rubble in Trench 5; view to the east.

Photograph 13. Brick foundation wall sections and demolition debris in Trench 6; view to the south.

Photograph 14. Demolition rubble in the west wall profile of Trench 6; view to the west.

Photograph 15. Sample of ceramic sherd recovered from Trench 6, Stratum III (Appendix A: Catalog #3).

Photograph 16. Sample of glass bottles recovered from Trench 6, Stratum III (Appendix A: Catalog #3).
1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 PURPOSE AND GOALS OF THE INVESTIGATION

John Milner Associates, Inc. (JMA) conducted a Phase 1B archeological investigation of Block 457, Lot 28 located on the north side of East First Street at Second Avenue in Manhattan. The archeological work was conducted on behalf of Avalon Bay Communities, Inc in advance of the construction of Chrystie Place III, a proposed mixed-use retail and residential building. Lot 28 is included within the former location of a Methodist Episcopal Cemetery that occupied the southeastern portion of Block 457 from 1805 until 1854. The lot was subsequently developed (ca. 1857–1862) with commercial and residential structures. The purpose of the Phase 1B investigation was to determine whether intact human burials, disarticulated human remains, and/or other archeological features are located within the areas to be affected by the proposed construction.

All work conducted by JMA was done in accordance with both the City Environmental Quality Review Technical Manual, the Landmarks Preservation Commission Guidelines for Archaeological Work in New York City (April 12, 2002)(the Guidelines) and, when appropriate, the New York Archaeological Council’s Standards for Cultural Resource Investigations and the Curation of Archaeological Collections recommended for use by the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation (OPRHP). OPRHP may have certain review obligations under Section 14.09 of the New York State Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation Law because of the involvement of the NYS Housing Finance Agency. However, JMA has assumed the LPC will be the primary review authority for the work proposed here.

1.2 PROJECT LOCATION AND DESCRIPTION

Block 457, Lot 28 (the Project Area) is located at the northwest corner of the intersection of East First Street and Second Avenue in Manhattan (Figure 1). The Project Area is currently occupied by two temporary construction trailers (Photographs 1–2). The proposed Chrystie Place III project is a mixed-use, seven-story building that will house two 16,000-square-foot retail spaces, 96 rental apartment units, and a garage at cellar level with a capacity for 104 vehicles and a ramp entrance from East First Street. The proposed building will have a gross square-footage of 128,872 feet.

1.3 PROJECT BACKGROUND

The proposed Chrystie Place III project is part of the larger Cooper Square Urban Renewal Plan (CSURP). The boundaries of the Cooper Square Urban Renewal Area include East Fifth Street on the north, Second Avenue and Chrystie Street on the east, Stanton Street on the south, and the Bowery on the west. It includes portions of Blocks 427, 456 and 457. The CSURP includes the proposed construction of 7-to-14-story buildings that will house up to 713 units of housing, up to 175,000 square feet of retail commercial space, a net increase of up to 64,118 square feet of community facility space, and up to 225 on-site parking spaces.

Under the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) procedure, the New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) as CEQR lead agency, was required to determine if the CSURP would have a significant effect on the environment. An environmental assessment was prepared, and HPD issued a revised Negative Declaration for the CSURP on June 7, 2001. The Negative Declaration references an historical overview and assessment prepared for the CSURP in August 2000, which identified areas that “may have potential for discovery of human remains, surviving from the relocation of two nineteenth century cemeteries” (Parsons 2000).

One of the former cemetery areas within the CSURP includes Block 457, Lot 28. Subsequent to the close of the Methodist Episcopal Cemetery (ca. 1855), the lot was subdivided and developed with commercial and residential structures. Within Lot 28, the historical overview and assessment identified archeologically sensitive areas that correspond to the areas where no subsequent construction is documented on historic maps (Figure 2). The Phase 1B archeological investigation was limited to these (apparently) undisturbed portions of Lot 28.

BLOCK 457, LOT 28
(FORMER METHODIST EPISCOPAL CEMETERY)
NEW YORK, NEW YORK
In addition to noting that a work plan must be approved by the LPC prior to any site grading or construction work in any of the cemetery areas within the CSURP, the Negative Declaration states that “the LPC is also requiring monitoring by a certified archeologist during construction” to identify human remains that may be present. At the request of the project proponents (Avalon Bay Communities, Inc.), JMA conducted a pre-construction archeological investigation of the potentially undisturbed portions of the former Methodist Episcopal Cemetery area that are located within Lot 28 to eliminate the need for construction monitoring.

The Phase IB investigation was conducted in accordance with a site-specific work plan, research design, and detailed protocol for dealing with the discovery of human remains that was submitted to and approved by LPC prior to the beginning of the field investigation. The human remains protocol (JMA 2005a; see Section 2.2) detailed the field methods that would be used for the excavation of burials, described the types of forensic analyses that might have been conducted in the event that human remains were recovered, established a timeline and list of contacts for notifications in the event that human remains were identified, and outlined the procedures for identification and reburial of the human remains. Copies of the protocol were provided to Avalon Bay, LPC, and the Church of All Nations prior to the start of the field investigations (see Section 2.2).

1.4 PROJECT PERSONNEL

Principal JMA personnel involved in the archeological investigation at Block 457, Lot 28 included Dr. Joel Klein, RPA (Senior Project Manager) and Patrick Heaton, RPA (Principal Archeologist). The field crew included Claudia Milne and Elizabeth Martin. John Wade served as the machine operator. Patrick Heaton identified and analyzed the artifacts recovered during the investigation and Claudia Milne identified the faunal remains. Sarah Ruch, Rob Schultz, and Mary Paradise prepared the graphics and maps. All supporting documentation for the report and recovered archeological materials are currently on file at JMA’s office in Croton-on-Hudson, New York.
2.0  BACKGROUND INFORMATION

2.1  HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The historical overview and assessment prepared for the CSURP (Parsons 2000) includes a detailed discussion of the history of the Methodist Episcopal Cemetery that was formerly located on Block 457. JMA also reviewed a report entitled Methodist Episcopal Cemetery: Intensive Documentary Study (HPI 2003) prepared in association with the proposed Second Avenue Subway project on behalf of the Metropolitan Transit Authority. These two reports provided much of the information related to the cemetery that is presented below. JMA also examined archival and cartographic sources (e.g., MHSCNY 1931; WPA 1940) in the collection of the New York Public Library and various municipal archives and on-line sources (e.g., NYC DOB 1961, 2005; NYC DEP n.d.; NYC DOR 1940) for additional information about the cemetery and later structures that were built on the lot.

Cemetery Period, ca. 1805–1855

A Methodist Episcopal Cemetery occupied present-day Block 457, Lot 28 between 1805 and 1854. In 1805 the Trustees of the Methodist Episcopal Church of the City of New York purchased portions of two contiguous lots from Nicholas Romine and Joseph Graham. In 1818 the Common Council of the City of New York, Committee on Assessments described this property as “a piece of ground ... used exclusively as a cemetery” (cited in HPI 2003:4). A history of the Methodist Episcopal Church includes a note that “many were interred” in the cemetery, but does not provide specific counts of burials (Seaman 1892:491; cited in Parsons 2000:27). Historical maps that depict the cemetery include the 1820 Randel survey, 1852 Dripps map (Figure 3), and 1853 Perris atlas.

Between 1836 and 1854 the congregations of four churches (the 7th Street [or Bowery Village] Methodist Episcopal Church, the Second Street Methodist Episcopal Church, the Allen Street Methodist Episcopal Church, and the Willett Street Methodist Episcopal Church) used the cemetery. All four of these churches were members of the Methodist Episcopal Church East Circuit. None of these four churches remain in existence today. The 1852 Dripps map depicts the four churches that owned a share in the cemetery. Based on the depictions on this map, the building footprints of all four of these churches filled the lots within which they were built. None of these churches appear to have had associated churchyards that could have been used as burial grounds (see also Parsons 2000:26).

According to the catalog of manuscript records from the Methodist Episcopal Church prepared by the Methodist Historical Society (MHSCNY 1931), the “Poor Fund Accounts” of the various congregations include records of the burials of “dependent members.” The catalog indicates that these records exist for the years 1795–1820, 1827–1831, and 1831–1838. The catalog also references a list of deaths from the period 1795–1815 that was evidently transcribed from a larger record. These records are all believed to be within the microfilm collections of the New York Public Library.

A summary history for the cemetery parcel is presented in Table 1. Table 1 also includes relevant details concerning legislative actions, reorganization of the Methodist Episcopal Church in New York, and details from historical maps that provide context for events directly related to the cemetery parcel.

---

1 In 1902 the Allen and Willett Street Churches were discontinued, the properties sold, and the resulting funds used to establish the Church of All Nations, which was formerly (ca. 1908) located at 9 Second Avenue. For this reason, JMA identified the Church of All Nations (currently located at 48 St. Mark’s Place) as the appropriate descendant congregation for the churches that formerly used the cemetery.
Table 1. Summary timeline of the Methodist Episcopal Cemetery (ca. 1805–1855) formerly located on Block 457.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Relevant Background Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1805</td>
<td>Nicholas Romine grants property on Block 457 to Trustees of the M.E. Church in the City of New York (Trustees); Joseph Graham grants additional property to Trustees; formation of cemetery lot</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1818</td>
<td>NYC Common Council Committee on Assessments refers to lot as “piece of ground ... exclusively used as a cemetery”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1820</td>
<td>Randel map identifies lot as “Methodist Cemetery” [sic]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1835</td>
<td>Trustees contemplate construction of a church on the lot, discuss problem of existing burials: “as there would be but few of the dead to be removed and those that would have to be removed should be deposited in a vault under the [proposed] church”; plan apparently abandoned</td>
<td>1835-1836 Reorganization of the M.E. Church of the City of New York into East and West Circuits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1835-1836</td>
<td>Trustees propose construction of 10 vaults within cemetery, each 8’x12’; construct only 4 vaults 14’ deep, of limestone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1836</td>
<td>Trustees grant lot in equal shares to: 1. Methodist Episcopal Church East Circuit 2. 7th Street (Bowery Village) M.E. Church 3. Second Street M.E. Church 4. Allen Street M.E. Church 5. Willett Street M.E. Church</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1837-1854</td>
<td>Tax Assessment records consistently identify “Methodist Cemetery” located at “First Street across from Second Avenue”</td>
<td>1847 NYS Rural Cemetery Act encourages creation of tax-exempt suburban cemeteries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1851</td>
<td>NYC Common Council legislation bans new burials below 86th Street</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1852</td>
<td>Dripps maps depicts 4 M.E. Churches that had shares in the cemetery; none of these churches appear to have associated churchyards that could have been used as burial grounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1853</td>
<td>M.E.C. East Circuit Trustees apply to NYS Supreme Court for permission to sell lot after removal of the dead and reburial in Cypress Hills or Evergreen Cemetery</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1854</td>
<td>M.E.C. East Circuit Trustees allocate funds for removal of the dead from lot</td>
<td>1854-1856 Inskeep (2000) states that 15,000 burials were removed from NYC Methodist Cemeteries to Cypress Hills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1854-1855</td>
<td>According to Trustees minutes, human remains exhumed from lot and re-interred in Cypress Hills Cemetery (HPI 2003:5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1855</td>
<td>M.E.C East Circuit and 4 member churches (above) grant lot to George Edwards</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1857-1862</td>
<td>Former cemetery subdivided into 13 lots and developed with commercial/residential structures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Methodist Episcopal Church East Circuit Trustees’ Minutes (the Minutes) include discussions concerning the installation of vaults within the cemetery:

The Building Committee “recommended the board to build 10 private vaults to be about 8 by 12 feet in the clear and built after the manner of vaults in the Marble Cemetery in 2nd Street... (October 1835). The Trustees chose to have four new public vaults ‘at the corner of 1st Street & 2nd Avenue’ each 14 feet in depth and to be made of limestone... (February 1836) (quoted in HPI 2003:7).

The vaults were finished by July 1836. Construction of the vaults seems to have been necessitated by an increase in the number of burials within the cemetery, as noted in the Minutes from December 1835 (HPI 2003:8). The Minutes...
from February 1854 include notes regarding the formation of a committee to “examine the oldest Vaults in the 1st Street Burying Ground with powers to have the same cleaned out if they deem it expedient” (quoted in HPI 2003:8). It is unclear whether instructions concerning the demolition and/or removal of the vault structures were included within this directive.

In 1855 the Trustees of the East Circuit sold the cemetery lot on Block 457. According to the Minutes, all of the burials were exhumed in 1854–1855 and re-interred in Cypress Hills Cemetery (HPI 2003:5, 8). In The Graveyard Shift: A Family Historians Guide to New York City Cemeteries, the author states that the Allen Street, Willent Street, and 7th Street Methodist Episcopal Churches “removed the dead in their churchyard[s] to a plot in Cypress Hills Cemetery. The removals began in 1854 and lasted for two years” (Inskeep 2000:6, 180, 215). However, these churches (as well as the Second Street Methodist Episcopal Church, which also had a share in the cemetery) are depicted on the 1852 Dripps map without associated churchyards. It seems likely that Inskeep is referring to records regarding the burials associated with each of these congregations, but mistakenly assumed that the burials originated in burial grounds located on the premises of each church. Presumably some of these burials were located within the Methodist Episcopal Cemetery on Block 457.

Inskeep (2000:109, 215) also states that 15,000 burials were removed from Methodist Cemeteries in New York to Cypress Hills between 1854 and 1856. The burials from the cemetery on Block 457 are assumed to be included within this number. An article from the Brooklyn Daily Eagle written approximately 40 years after the relocations occurred suggests that the exhumations and reburials were conducted in a haphazard fashion:

On June 5, 1855 the Trustees of Cypress Hills Cemetery presented the plot to the Trustees of the Forsythe Street, the Allen Street, the Willet Street and Seventh Street Methodist Episcopal Churches of New York... The remains exhumed from their resting places of many years were carted to East New York and placed in trenches prepared for their reception. The gravestones were. with few exceptions. thrown into the corner .... A very few stones, mostly chipped and broken, were put up about the place, but they mean nothing. If they cover the bones of him or her they were intended to represent, it is by accident. No care was taken in the removal and no care has been given to the plot (Brooklyn Daily Eagle, August 8, 1893, page 8, column 7; quoted in Parsons 2000:29).

The historical overview and assessment prepared for the project notes that although the graves located within the Methodist Episcopal Cemetery were presumably relocated during the 1850s, the “process of cemetery relocation was not always systematic or complete” (Parsons 2000:35). The assessment concluded that “human remains may still be present in apparently clear areas” because unmarked graves could have been easily overlooked during grave relocation activities.

**Commercial/Residential Period, ca. 1857–present**

Between 1857 and 1862 the former cemetery was subdivided into 13 lots (historical Lots 32–44) (see Figure 2) and developed with commercial/residential structures. It is likely that most of the area formerly occupied by the cemetery was disturbed in association with the construction of basements and foundations for these buildings. The proposed project includes historical Lots 36–44; existing structures occupy the remaining lots within the former cemetery (Lots 32–35).

The 1868 Perris atlas and 1875 Robinson atlas (Figure 4) depict the arrangement of structures that were built on the newly subdivided lots. Further details regarding the size, appearance, and construction of the mid-nineteenth-century buildings are provided on the 1879 Galt & Hoy perspective drawing (Figure 5) and 1903 Sanborn atlas. Structures built on the lots within the project area included four-story brick tenements with street-level storefronts (19 and 21 Second Avenue; 14 and 16 East First Street), three-story brick apartments with street-level storefronts (18–24 East First Street), a single-story commercial building (26 East First Street), a four-story warehouse (12 East First Street), and five-story tenements at 4–6 Extra Place and within an interior courtyard (former Lot 43).

Around 1911, most of the structures within the project area were demolished and replaced with a large theater. The 1916 Bromley atlas (Figure 6) depicts the four-story Kessler Theater (or Second Avenue Theater) occupying the entirety of historic Lots 38–43. The theater also included two structures that served as lobbies/entrances at 29 East
Second Street and 35 Second Avenue (both of these structures are located outside of the Project Area). The Second Avenue Theater was demolished in 1958–1959 and the lot subsequently used as a parking lot (Cypkin 1985:112; NYC DOB 2005). The late-nineteenth-century structures at 12 East First Street and 19–21 Second Avenue were not demolished at the time the theater was built and remained on the lot through the early-twentieth century. Ca. 1940 tax-assessment photographs (Figures 7–9) (NYC DOR 1940) document the appearance and size of these buildings.

The theater occupied most of the area of the former cemetery, excepting two narrow alleys located along the northern and eastern perimeters of the lot. The 1947 Sanborn atlas (Figure 10) identifies these narrow alleys as “vaulted yards”, which suggests that they likely served as roofed-over exits from the theater. The alley on the eastern side of the theater is clearly visible in the ca. 1940 tax-assessment photograph (NYC DaR 1940) that depicts the rear of the theater from East First Street (Figure 8).

The four-story commercial structure located at 12 East First Street (historic Lot 44) is identified as a “macaroni factory” on the 1947 Sanborn atlas. The building continued to be used for storage and manufacturing purposes (NYC DOB 1961) and was eventually demolished in 1992 (NYC DOB 2005). The four-story tenements located at 19 and 21 Second Avenue (historic Lots 36 and 37) were also demolished in 1992. The small single-story structure located at 26 East First Street (also within historic Lot 37) was demolished in 1997 (NYC DOB 2005).

Regarding the archeological potential for residential lots with the CSURP area, the historic and overview and assessment concluded that:

The most likely location for discovering [historically significant] artifact assemblages ... would be deep shaft features, such as wells, cisterns, or privies, located in the rear yards of undisturbed lots... If the documented dates for structures on the study area blocks pre-date the availability of municipal water and sewer hook-ups, then the potential exists for encountering water-related features in association with these structures (Parsons 2000:38).

The original structures built in the project area (Figures 4–5) were constructed ca. 1860. According to records maintained by the Bureau of Sewer and Water Operations (NYC DEP n.d.) municipal water and sewer lines were not installed in the adjacent streets until much later. The Constructed Sewerage Systems map indicates that main lines were installed on Second Avenue south of East First Street in 1880 and north of East First Street in 1882; the main line along East First Street (between Bowery and Second Avenue) was installed in 1941. Staff personnel at the DEP suggested the 1941 installation may have replaced an earlier line, but were not aware of any records available to confirm or disprove that possibility.

2.2 RESEARCH DESIGN

The purpose of field-testing as defined in the Guidelines is to “determine whether the site actually contains significant archeological resources, as opposed to whether such resources may potentially exist on the site.” All work described here was conducted in accordance with the Guidelines.

Potential Mortuary Deposits

The portion of Lot 28 that was believed to have a potential to contain human remains corresponds to the narrow alley that defined the northern and eastern perimeters of historic Lot 38 (Figure 2). This narrow alley was located outside of the footprint of the former Second Avenue Theater depicted on early-twentieth-century insurance maps (Figures 5, 10). Archeological testing associated with the former cemetery was confined to this area.

JMA personnel directed a backhoe to excavate test trenches within the area of these narrow alleyways. The profiles of these trenches were examined to identify the interface between fill deposits and the underlying sandy soils, or to determine the depths of disturbance associated with the construction and/or demolition of the theater. Excavation spoil was examined for the presence of disarticulated remains. Trench profiles were also examined for the presence of disarticulated remains and evidence of the possible presence of burials or other features.
Human Remains Protocol

A site-specific work plan, research design, and detailed protocol for dealing with the discovery of human remains during the archeological investigation (JMA 2005a) was submitted to LPC on June 24, 2005 and approved on July 11, 2005. The human remains protocol detailed the field methods that would be used for the excavation of burials, described the types of forensic analyses that might have been conducted in the event that human remains were recovered, established a timeline and list of contacts for notifications in the event that human remains were identified, and outlined the procedures for identification and reburial of the human remains. Copies of the protocol were provided to Avalon Bay, LPC, and the Church of All nations prior to the start of the field investigations.

As a component of preparing the work plan and human remains protocol, JMA contacted Reverend Hector Laporta, Pastor of the Church of All Nations at 48 Saint Mark’s Place, regarding the proposed archeological investigation. The purposes of these communications were to discuss the alternative approaches to dealing with any human remains that may be encountered; to determine the level of involvement with JMA’s work that the Church of All Nations would like to have; and to identify and discuss any concerns or special requirements the Church may have regarding the project. The results of these conversations with Reverend Laporta included the following: the Reverend confirmed that he was the appropriate individual to discuss the Project with and could speak on behalf of the Church of All Nations; he indicated that the Church would like to be notified if JMA identified human remains in the field and expressed an interest in observing the fieldwork at some point during the course of the investigation; he indicated that the Church of All Nations did not want to be responsible for the disposition of any human remains in the event that human remains were encountered; he indicated that the Church did not object to any forensic analyses that might be conducted as part of the laboratory analysis and reporting associated with the Project. Reverend Laporta indicated that he had forwarded JMA’s communications to the Bishop at the New York Annual Conference and that the regional organization was aware of the proposed archeological investigations. The Reverend also indicated that it was not necessary for JMA to communicate directly with the New York Annual Conference.

In a telephone conversation on May 25, 2005, Reverend Laporta indicated that his church was not interested in receiving human remains for the purposes of reburial. He also indicated that he felt reburial in a public cemetery was appropriate. JMA contacted the Office of the Chief Medical Examiner (OCME) of the City of New York regarding the disposition of recovered remains. An OCME representative (Ms. Canty) indicated that OCME would accept the remains for reburial and indicated that their office should be notified immediately in the event that human remains were identified during fieldwork. OCME indicated that more specific details regarding custody and transfer of any recovered remains would be negotiated at that time.

Potential Non-Mortuary Archeological Deposits

JMA anticipated that potentially significant archeological features or deposits located within the Project Area could include wells, cisterns, or privies that are filled with domestic and/or commercial refuse associated with the nineteenth-century occupants of the lots; intact former yard surfaces with undisturbed historical midden (i.e., scatters of domestic refuse) deposits; and intact, buried ground surfaces that have the potential to contain deposits associated with the prehistoric and/or Contact Period Native American occupation of Manhattan.

---

2 JMA identified the Church of All Nations (currently located at 48 St. Mark’s Place) as the appropriate descendant congregation for the churches that formerly used the cemetery. Between 1836 and 1854 the congregations of the 7th Street [or Bowery Village] Methodist Episcopal Church, the Second Street Methodist Episcopal Church, the Allen Street Methodist Episcopal Church, and the Willet Street Methodist Episcopal Church used the Methodist Episcopal Cemetery located on Block 457. None of these four churches remain in existence today. In 1902 the Allen and Willet Street Churches were discontinued, the properties sold, and the resulting funds used to establish the Church of All Nations, which was formerly (ca. 1908) located at 9 Second Avenue.

3 The Church of All Nations is a member of the New York Annual Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, which is based in White Plains, New York. The New York Annual Conference functions for the contemporary church in a manner that is analogous to the role of the Methodist Episcopal Church East Circuit during the nineteenth century.
3.0 Research Methods

3.1 Archaeological Field Methods

John Milner Associates (JMA) conducted the archeological fieldwork within portions of Block 457, Lot 28 between July 13 and July 15, 2005. A backhoe and operator, working under the supervision of JMA archeologists, removed deposits of fill and overburden. Excavation continued until subsoil or a potentially significant archeological deposit was encountered, or until it became clear that twentieth-century construction and/or demolition had destroyed any potential archeological features.

Information regarding all archeological test excavations was recorded regardless of whether archeological features were identified. In the following discussion, excavation depths are described in terms of feet (or inches) below ground surface (bgs). The locations of all test trenches were plotted on a map of the Project Area (Figure 11). Stratigraphic profiles were drawn and photographed for all trenches excavated in the course of field-testing (Figure 12–14).

Representative samples of artifacts from the various fill layers and soil deposits were also recovered. This material was used to date episodes of disturbance across the Project Area. Recovered artifacts were placed in plastic bags labeled with provenience information and returned to JMA's laboratory for processing.

3.2 Laboratory Methods

Recovered artifacts were returned to JMA’s laboratory in Croton-on-Hudson, New York, for further analysis. All recovered artifacts were cleaned, inventoried, and cataloged. To the extent possible, the recovered artifacts were identified as to material, temporal or cultural/chronological association, style, and function. Artifacts were identified and dated using standard references (e.g., Apuzzo 1994; Brown 1982; Coysh and Henrywood 1982; Dieringer and Dieringer 2001; Jones et al. 1989; Lindsey 2005; Sussman 1997). The artifacts were placed in heavy duty, archival quality zip-lock plastic bags for long-term storage, and a provenience tag printed on acid-free paper was placed in each bag. The provenience information was also recorded on the outside of the bags, using an indelible marker. A complete inventory of all artifacts recovered during the Phase 1B investigation is included in Appendix A.

The primary goal of the faunal analysis conducted for the Phase 1B investigation was to determine whether human remains were present. The recovered faunal remains were identified according to species and body part. Where possible, each bone or bone fragment was identified to species using conventional zooarcheological techniques (e.g., Grayson 1979, 1984; Klein and Cruz-UrIBE 1984). Measurements of the bones were taken following von den Driesch (1976). When species-level of identification was not possible, a series of higher order taxonomic categories was used. The category sheep/goat was used for caprine remains. Bone fragments not identifiable to species or family were assigned to categories such as large or medium mammal. A complete inventory of all faunal remains recovered during the Phase 1B investigation is included in Appendix B.
4.0 RESULTS AND INTERPRETATIONS

4.1 RESULTS OF FIELDWORK

JMA conducted archaeological field investigations within Block 456, Lot 28 between July 13 and July 15, 2005. The fieldwork included the excavation of a nearly continuous trench along the northern and eastern perimeter of the lot (Figure 11). Trench sections ranged from 6 to 10 feet in width. The total length of test trenches was approximately 220 feet. The depth of trench sections ranged from 2 to 12 feet below the existing ground surface (bgs).

For the purposes of recording proveniences, documenting stratigraphy, and photographing the excavations, the nearly continuous trench was sub-divided into arbitrary sections designated Trenches 1–6 (Figure 11). Horizontal proveniences were recorded according to stationing marked at 10-foot intervals along the perimeter of the lot. For the trench sections excavated parallel to the northern perimeter of the lot, observations were recorded as feet east (e.g., 75 feet E) of the northwest corner of the lot (at Extra Place). For trench sections excavated parallel to the eastern perimeter of the lot, locations and observations were recorded as feet south (e.g., 25 feet S) of the northeast corner of the lot (at the rear wall of 29 Second Avenue). Trenches 1–3 were excavated parallel to the northern perimeter of Lot 28; Trenches 4–6 were excavated parallel to the eastern perimeter of Lot 28 (Figure 11).

Trenches 1 and 2

Trench 1 was approximately 6 feet wide (north-to-south) and extended from 0–85 feet east from the east side of Extra Place (Figure 11). Within the northwestern corner of the trench, brick basement/foundation walls were observed in situ along the western and northern perimeters of the lot. The tops of these walls were located at 1.5 feet bgs with a single course of cut stone along the tops of the walls (Figure 12). The foundation walls were overlain by a recently dumped layer of clean fill with crushed stone (Stratum 1; 0–.5 feet bgs), a thin lens of asphalt paving (at .5 feet bgs), and layer of dark reddish gray fill with brick rubble, asphalt chunks, and demolition debris (Stratum II; .5–1.5 feet bgs). The interior of the basement was filled with light reddish brown demolition debris primarily composed of bricks, brick rubble, mortar, and beams of structural steel (Stratum III). The demolition debris was removed within the western portion of the trench to determine the depth of the foundation. The intact cement floor of the basement was documented at 12 feet bgs (Figure 12).

Between 10–75 feet east from the east side of Extra Place, Trench 1 was excavated to a depth of only 2.5 feet bgs. The fill and rubble deposits were removed to a depth sufficient to determine that the foundation wall along the north lot-line was extant, and to confirm that brick rubble and demolition debris characterized the area located south of this wall (Photograph 3). At the eastern end of Trench 1, between 75–85 feet east from Extra Place, the debris deposit was removed to 12 feet bgs to confirm that the intact basement floor was still present at that depth. The foundation wall along the north lot line was visible in the east wall profile for Trench 1 (Photograph 4) and appears to continue to the east. The uniformity between the stratigraphic relationships of deposits, the depth of the rubble, and the depth of the cement floor at the two ends of the trench confirms that the entirety of Trench 1 was located within a former basement that extends to 12 feet bgs.

JMA personnel recovered a single tooth from the back-dirt pile at the eastern end of Trench 1. The tooth was recovered while monitoring the machine-aided excavation for human remains and/or artifacts. Preliminary identification in the field determined that the tooth was a lower incisor of a medium-sized mammal. Subsequent laboratory identification confirmed that the tooth was a pig incisor (Appendix B: Catalog #1). No other artifacts or faunal remains were collected from Trench 1.

Trench 2 extended between 85–130 feet east from the east side of Extra Place. The trench was offset approximately 9 feet south from Trench 1 due to an irregularity in the contemporary property line (Figure 11). The southern perimeter of Trench 2 was defined by another east-west-running brick basement/foundation wall. The 6-foot-wide trench extended north to the property line. A series of north-south-running wall segments and steel beams (that extended into the north wall of the trench) were observed at 95, 100, and 130 feet east from Extra Place (Figures 11,
4.0 RESULTS AND INTERPRETATIONS

These wall segments likely connect the southern wall to the (unexcavated) wall to the north that was the northern perimeter of Trench 1 (located along the original northern lot line, but outside the current limits of Lot 28). The depth of the basement floor within Trench 2 was confirmed (at 12 feet bgs) between 95–110 feet and at approximately 125 feet east from the east side of Extra Place. Deposits within Trench 2 included the same layers of demolition debris observed in Trench 1 (Photographs 5–7) as well as pockets of pale brown sand, mortar, and cinders mixed with dark gray bands of ash (Stratum IV; Figure 13) in isolated areas within the debris.

Trench 3

Trench 3 was excavated in the northeast corner of Lot 28, and covered the area between 130-142 feet east (along the north lot line) and 2–10 feet south along the east lot line (Figure 11). This portion of the Project Area was the only excavated area that was not entirely characterized by demolition debris, and appeared to represent a small area outside of the foundation of the Second Avenue Theater (Photograph 8). Excavations between the surface and 3.5 feet bgs in Trench 3 proceeded through brick rubble deposits (Strata I–III; Figure 14) comparable to other portions of the Project Area.

Stratum IV, light brown sandy fill with relatively lesser quantities of brick rubble, was observed at 3.5 feet bgs. JMA personnel instructed the machine operator to proceed very carefully through Stratum IV and the underlying deposits by exposing the horizontal surface at the bottom of Stratum III across the entire length of the trench. Machine-aided excavation then proceeded in approximately 4-inch-thick horizontal layers. During this stripping, archeologists carefully monitored the exposed soil surfaces for indications of grave shafts and monitored the back-dirt for the appearance of bones or artifacts. The light brown sandy fill (Stratum IV; Figure 14) was underlain by pockets of dark brown and yellowish brown loamy fill with ash, mortar, cinders, and nineteenth-century artifacts (Stratum V) and very pale brown sand, mortar, and cinders (Stratum VI). These mixed deposits sloped from 5 feet bgs adjacent to the foundation wall in the southern portion of the trench to 8 feet bgs along the northern wall of Trench 3 (Figure 14). The ashy and artifact-bearing deposits directly overlay reddish brown sand with gravel, pebbles, and cobbles (Stratum VII) observed in Trench 3 at 6 feet bgs. Stratum VII represents glacially deposited subsoil.

The assemblage of artifacts recovered from the Stratum V deposits (Appendix A: Catalog #2) consists of highly fragmented ceramic and glass sherds (Photographs 9–10), many of which could not be ascribed to individual vessels or even specific vessel types or forms. In general, the recovered artifacts suggest deposition in the late-nineteenth century. JMA personnel also recovered 12 bones or bone fragments from Stratum V (Appendix B: Catalog #2). Species represented included chicken, cow, pig, sheep/goat, indeterminate medium-sized bird, and indeterminate large mammal. Clear evidence of butchery marks were observed on two large-mammal rib fragments. No human remains were identified in the assemblage.

The ceramic assemblage from Stratum V consists of 56 sherds including 3 salt-glazed gray stoneware, 1 Bristol-glazed stoneware, 3 sponge-decorated white stoneware, 35 plain or undecorated ironstone, 3 gilt-rimmed ironstone, 7 molded-rim ironstone, 1 hotelware, 1 redware, and 2 yellowware (Photograph 9). One of the ironstone sherds bore part of the maker’s mark for “Semi-Vitreous Porcelain, United States Pottery Co., Wellsville, OH, U.S.A.” indicating production date between 1898 and 1932 (Kovel and Kovel 1986). The glass assemblage (Photograph 10) consists of 20 fragments that represent at least 5 vessels. These include the base of a Ricketts-mold produced bottle (ca. 1820–1920) and neck–lip fragment of a post-mold bottle with a crown finish (post-1892) (Jones et al. 1989). The ironstone sherd with the maker’s mark and bottle fragment with a crown finish both suggest that the assemblage was deposited no earlier than the 1890s. The lack of identifiable machine-made bottles among the recovered artifacts suggests that the assemblage dates to the period prior to 1903.

The artifact assemblage was recovered from a mixed fill deposit of ash, mortar, and cinders that appears to have been dumped into a builder’s trench associated with the construction of the foundation for the Second Avenue Theater (ca. 1911). The only architectural feature observed in the vicinity of these finds during the excavation of Trench 3 was the brick basement wall of the Theater that formed the southern boundary of the trench. No other stone or brick walls (or wall sections) were observed in the vicinity, so there is no evidence that the recovered artifacts represent fill from an earlier feature that was disturbed during the construction of the Theater. Because the artifacts
RESULTS AND INTERPRETATIONS

were recovered from mixed fill deposits not associated with any specific feature or property, it is not possible to associate the assemblage with a specific structure, occupant, or business concern in the vicinity.

Undisturbed glacially deposited subsoil was documented on two nearby lots during recent archeological investigations in the vicinity of the Project Area. On Block 456, Lot 1 (located opposite the Project Area on the south side of East First Street and at comparable grade) glacially derived reddish brown sand with gravel and cobbles was documented at 6 to 9 feet bgs in the rear yard areas of historic lots 11 and 12 (JMA 2005b). On Block 457, Lot 1 (located just west of the Project Area at the corner of East First Street and Bowery) glacially derived strong brown sand was documented at depths of 3 feet and 8 feet bgs (JMA 2004). The soil stratigraphy documented during the previous archeological investigations in the vicinity confirms that the subsoil observed in Trench 3 at 6 feet bgs is in situ. The depth of subsoil observed in Trench 3 (approximately 6 feet bgs) indicates that the basement of the former Second Avenue Theater (documented at 12 feet bgs in the adjacent trenches) exceeds the depths at which pre-development archeological deposits are likely to be located.

No indications of grave shafts or other indications of human burials were observed within any of the soil horizons exposed in Trench 3.

Trenches 4–6

Trench 4 extended along the eastern lot line between 10–27 feet south from the northeast corner of Lot 28 (Figure 11). The northern wall of Trench 4 was the brick foundation wall that formed the southern wall of Trench 3. Trench 3 extended 20 feet west along this foundation wall from the eastern perimeter of Lot 28. This portion of the Project Area exhibited identical stratigraphy to Trenches 1 and 2 (Figures 12, 13). Brick rubble and demolition debris were removed from the trench to a depth of 9 feet bgs (Photograph 11). The rubble was removed to 12 feet bgs (to a cement floor) in the northeast corner of the trench to confirm the depth of the basement. The presence and depth of the rubble in this area indicates that the basement of the Second Avenue Theater extended under the eastern alleyway to the eastern perimeter of the lot.

Trench 5 was excavated along the eastern lot line between 32–40 feet south from the northeast corner of Lot 28 (Figure 11). The southern limit of the trench was defined by the presence of aboveground temporary plumbing lines that provided running water to the construction trailer. Trench 5 was excavated to a depth of 6 feet bgs and was entirely filled with brick rubble and demolition debris (Photograph 12).

Trench 6 was excavated in the area of the former alley east of the theater between 80–120 feet south from the northeast corner of the lot (Figure 11). The trench extended to the southern lot line along East First Street. Brick wall segments were documented that defined the southeast corner of the former theater's basement. The basement of the theater extended to 1-foot north of the sidewalk on the north side of East First Street (Photograph 13). The entirety of Trench 6 was excavated to a depth of approximately 4 feet bgs. The northern end of the trench was excavated to 9 feet bgs (Photograph 12), with a small exploratory extension to 12 feet bgs to confirm the presence and depth of the basement floor. The trench was entirely filled with demolition debris and brick rubble (Photographs 13–14).

JMA personnel observed a deposit of glass bottles, vinyl tiles, and miscellaneous debris within the brick rubble in Trench 6 located at approximately 90–95 feet south from the northeast corner of the lot, between 2 and 4 feet bgs. The debris seemed to occupy a distinct 6-foot-long void that was not defined by intact stone or brick elements. There were no indications that the void was an intentional structure within the debris. JMA field personnel recovered a representative sample of the artifacts from this area (Appendix A: Catalog #3). The artifacts were collected from the back-dirt during the course of the machine-aided excavation.

The artifacts recovered from Trench 6 (Photographs 15–16) generally date to the mid-twentieth century and included numerous liquor bottles (many of which were intact). The 13 ceramic sherds recovered from the deposit (Photograph 15) included hotelware (n=2), plain/undecorated ironstone (n=2), fiestaware (n=6), redware (n=1), and yellowware (n=1). One of the sherds of turquoise fiestaware bore a partial maker's mark for “GENUINE FIESTA ... U.S.A.”. The Homer J. Laughlin Company of Ohio produced the original fiestaware between 1936 and 1969; the presence of

BLOCK 457, LOT 28
(FORMER METHODIST EPISCOPAL CEMETERY)
NEW YORK, NEW YORK
the term “Genuine” in the mark indicates production date of 1940 or later (Snyder 2002). The other ceramic sherds
do not provide comparably definitive date ranges, however, the kitschy orange and black tiger-stripe pattern painted
on the redware sherd is suggestive of the 1960s. The 32 glass bottles (or bottle fragments) recovered from the
deposit (Photograph 16) included 16 identifiable liquor bottles, 5 soda bottles, and 5 condiment bottles/jars (the
other 6 vessels or fragments were not identifiable as to specific function or contents). Most of these bottles were
intact or were represented by more than 75% of the vessel, suggesting that these bottles did not originate within the
theater prior to the demolition of the structure (wherein one would expect significantly more breakage related to the
collapse of the building). All but 3 of the glass vessels (or vessel fragments) recovered from the deposit were
machine-made bottles, which indicates production after 1903. The embossed mark “CANADA DRY GINGER
ALE, INC./NEW YORK” on a green soda bottle indicates production after 1923 (DP/SUI 2005). Among the
assemblage of liquor bottles, seven bore the embossed mark “FEDERAL LAW PROHIBITS SALE OR RE-USE
OF THIS BOTTLE”, which was legally required on all liquor bottles sold in the United States between 1935 and
1964 (Lindsey 2005). The base of an amber soda bottle bore the embossed trademark of the Owens-Illinois Glass
Company marked with a production date of 1958 (Lockhart 2004).

The artifacts seem to represent an isolated dumping episode that occurred at about the same time (ca. 1958–1959)
that the Second Avenue Theater was demolished. The fiestaware and embossed liquor bottles provide consistent
dates between the late-1930s and mid-1960s; the Owens-Illinois soda bottle (with a 1958 trademark) indicates that
the assemblage was likely deposited during or immediately following the demolition of the theater. The types of
artifacts, primarily liquor, soda, and condiment bottles, suggest that the assemblage was associated with one of the
numerous bars or restaurants that populated the Bowery neighborhood throughout the twentieth century. The
presence of 8 bottles that represent 5 different varieties of scotch whiskey provides a strong indication that the
assemblage was associated with a commercial purveyor of alcohol as opposed to a private residence. It is possible
that the artifacts may be associated with the theater (perhaps from a bar located in the lobby), but also possible that
these artifacts represent a refuse dump by a local business that capitalized on an available hole in the rubble during
the demolition of the theater. Given the provenience of these finds within undifferentiated rubble located inside the
basement of a demolished theater, it is not possible to associate the assemblage with a specific structure, occupant,
or business concern in the vicinity.

The rubble assemblage from Trench 6 also included 4 bones or bone fragments (Appendix B: Catalog #3). Species
represented included 1 chicken femur, 2 cow ribs, and 1 cow vertebra. All three of the cow bones showed clear
evidence of butchery marks. No human remains were identified in the assemblage.

The area between 40–80 feet south along the eastern lot line was not accessible during the fieldwork because of the
presence of a temporary construction trailer and temporary utility connections that ran aboveground to the rear wall
of 23 Second Avenue. Virtually identical deposits of brick rubble were documented in Trenches 4, 5, and
(Trenches 6 located
immediately north of and south of this area). JMA assumes that the area between 40–80 feet south along the east lot
line is also characterized by the same deposit of debris and rubble associated with the demolition of the Second
Avenue Theater. Based on the results in the adjacent trenches, JMA personnel did not feel the logistical challenges
and expenses associated with moving the utility connections were justifiable or necessary.

4.2 INTERPRETATIONS

The Second Avenue Theater on Block 457 (Figures 6, 8, 10) was constructed ca. 1911 during the heyday of the
Yiddish theater in New York. Yiddish theater was an artistic tradition that arose from Jewish immigrant culture on
the Lower East Side during the late 1880s. The earliest performances were staged in beer gardens and auditoriums
on the Bowery. The scripts were mostly translations of classic and contemporary dramas, or original works heavily
padded with scenes, characters, or plots from other sources. The productions were filled with nostalgic references to
the Old Country and included traditional religious rituals such as weddings or lighting of the Sabbath candles. By
the early 1900s the productions featured a range of topics from serious drama to shund, a Yiddish term for blatantly
commercial melodrama with topics such as wayward wives, drunken husbands, or cruel landlords. During the 1920s
and 1930s the genre began to abandon its folksy roots in favor of explicitly artistic, intellectual, and political themes
Yiddish theater enjoyed a commercial boom during World War I, which included the construction of a new theater district - the “Yiddish Broadway” - along Second Avenue between Houston and Fourteenth Streets. The Second Avenue Theater was built especially for the actor David Kessler (a major star of the time) and was an elegantly appointed, 1,900-seat venue that cost approximately one million dollars (Kanfer 2004; Nahshon 1992). The last season of stage productions at the theater was 1955–1956. The Darl Parking Corporation purchased the property and began demolition of the structure on December 4, 1958. Demolition was completed in 1959 (Cypkin 1985:112).

The Phase 1B archeological work documented that the basement of the ca. 1911–1958 theater exceeded the size of the map-documented footprint for the building. Fire insurance maps (Figures 6, 10) depict narrow alleys along the northern and eastern perimeters of the theater. However, intact foundation wall sections observed in archeological test trenches indicate that the basement of the theater extended to the perimeters of the lot. All portions of the basement documented by JMA were filled with demolition debris, primarily composed of brick rubble. The intact cement floor of the basement was documented in numerous locations at a depth of 12 feet below the existing ground surface. The map-documented narrow alleys along the north and east perimeters of the former theater (Figures 6, 10) were also underlain by the same basement filled with rubble. The map reference on the 1947 Sanborn atlas (Figure 10) to “vaulted yards” apparently indicates that these alleys were open space built over subterranean storage areas or basement extensions.

The only excavated portion of the Project Area that was not characterized by filled basement and demolition debris was a small, 10-foot-by-15-foot area located in the northeast corner of the lot (Trench 3). This area contained fill soils of mixed ash, cinder, and mortar with late-nineteenth-century artifacts. The artifact-bearing fill stratum was underlain by undisturbed subsoil (sand with gravel and cobbles) at a depth of approximately 6 feet below the existing ground surface. The depth of subsoil observed in Trench 3 indicates that the basement of the former Second Avenue Theater (documented at 12 feet bgs in the adjacent trenches) exceeds the depths at which pre-development archeological deposits are likely to be located.

No indications of burial shafts were observed in any portion of the excavated areas. No human remains were recovered during the investigation.
5.0 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Block 457, Lot 28 is the within the former (ca. 1805–1855) location of a Methodist Episcopal Cemetery. Available records indicate that the Trustees of the Methodist Episcopal Church of the City of New York sold the cemetery lot on Block 457 in 1855, and all of the burials were exhumed and re-interred in Cypress Hills Cemetery. Between 1857 and 1862 the former cemetery was subdivided into 13 lots and developed with commercial/residential structures. In 1911 these structures were demolished and replaced with the four-story Kessler Theater (or Second Avenue Theater), which occupied most of the area of the former cemetery until 1958. The portions of the former cemetery that were considered to have a potential to contain human remains were two narrow (approximately ten-foot-wide) alleys located along the northern and eastern perimeters of the former theater.

JMA conducted the fieldwork for the Phase IB investigation within Block 457, Lot 28 between July 13 and July 15, 2005. The fieldwork included the excavation of a nearly continuous trench along the northern and eastern perimeter of the lot. Trench sections ranged from 6 to 10 feet in width. The total length of test trenches was approximately 220 feet. The depth of trench sections ranged from 2 to 12 feet below the existing ground surface.

The archeological investigation documented that the basement of the ca. 1911–1958 Second Avenue Theater exceeded the size of the map-documented footprint of the building. Intact basement wall sections extended to the perimeters of the lot. All portions of the basement documented by JMA were filled with demolition debris, primarily composed of brick rubble. The intact cement floor of the basement was documented in numerous locations at an approximate depth of 12 feet below the existing ground surface. Mid-twentieth-century artifacts (primarily alcohol bottles/fragments) were collected from within the brick rubble from a small area located approximately 20 feet north of East First Street; these materials were collected as a representative sample of the types of refuse included in the demolition debris. The narrow alleys along the north and east perimeters of the former theater were also underlain by basement filled with rubble.

The only portion of the project area that was not characterized by filled basement and demolition debris was a small, 10-foot-by-15-foot area located in the northeast corner of the lot. This area contained fill soils of mixed ash, cinder, and mortar with late-nineteenth-century artifacts. The artifact-bearing fill stratum was underlain by undisturbed subsoil (sand with gravel and cobbles) at a depth of approximately 6 feet below the existing ground surface. The depth of subsoil observed in this area indicates that the basement of the former Second Avenue Theater (documented at 12 feet bgs in the adjacent trenches) exceeds the depths at which pre-development archeological deposits are likely to be located.

No human remains were observed in any portion of the project area. The depth of disturbance associated with the construction of the basement of the former Second Avenue Theater precludes the possibility that intact human remains are located within the Project Area.

5.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

No intact burials, human remains, or other archeologically significant deposits or features were observed or recovered during the course of the Phase 1B investigation. In the opinion of JMA, no additional archeological work is necessary in association with the proposed development of Block 457, Lot 28.
6.0 REFERENCES CITED

Appuzzo, Robert

Bromley, George W., and Walter S. Bromley

Brown, Ann R.

Coysh, A. W. and R. K. Henrywood

Cypkin, Diane

Dieringer, Ernie, and Bev Dieringer

Dripps, Matthew
1851 Map of the City of New York Extending Northward to 50th Street. Collections of the New York Public Library Maps Division, New York.

Dr. Pepper/Seven Up, Inc. (DP/SUI)

Grayson, Donald K.


Historical Perspectives, Inc. (HPI)

Inskeep, Carolee

John Milner Associates, Inc. (JMA)


New York City Department of Buildings (NYC DOB) 1961  Certificate of Occupancy, 12 East 1st Street, Block 457, Tax Lot 44.


New York City Department of Records (NYC DOR) 1940  Tax Assessment Photographs of Standing Structures. Microfilm Collection, City of New York Municipal Archives, Department of Records and Information Services, New York.

REFERENCES CITED

Perris and Browne

Randel, John
1820 Farm Maps. Borough of Manhattan, Office of the President, Topographic Bureau.

Robinson, Elisha, and Roger Pidgeon

Sanborn Map Company

Sandrow, Nahma

Seaman, Samuel

Snyder, Jeffrey B.

Sussman, Lynne

United States Geological Survey (USGS)

Von den Driesch, A.

Works Progress Administration (WPA)
1940 Inventory of the Church Archives of New York City: The Methodist Church. The Historical Records Survey, New York.
Figures
Figure 1. Detail of the Jersey City, N.J.-N.Y. and Brooklyn, N.Y. (USGS 1981, 1979) 7.5-minute quadrangles showing the location of the Project Area (Block 457, Lot 28).
Figure 2. Map of Block 457 showing historic lot designations and areas of "archaeological potential" (modified from Parsons 2000:Figure 18a).
Figure 3. Detail of the 1852 Dripps Map of the City of New York showing the location of the former Methodist Episcopal Cemetery on Block 457.
Figure 4. Detail of the 1875 Robinson *Atlas of the City of New York* showing the arrangement of mid-nineteenth-century structures within the Project Area.
Figure 5. Detail of the 1879 Galt & Hoy perspective drawing/bird’s eye map showing the vicinity of the Project Area.
Figure 6. Detail of the 1916 Bromley Atlas of the City of New York showing the Second Avenue Theater and other structures located within the Project Area.
Figure 7. Historic tax-assessment photograph (NYC DOR 1940) depicting the former 4-story commercial structure located at 12 East First Street (Block 457, Historic Lot 44), from East First Street across from the corner of Extra Place.
Figure 8. Historic tax-assessment photograph (NYC DOR 1940) depicting the rear of the former Second Avenue Theatre located on Block 457, Historic Lot 38, from East First Street.
Figure 9. Historic tax-assessment photograph (NYC DOR 1940) depicting the former structures located at 19 Second Avenue (Block 457, Historic Lot 36), from the corner of Second Avenue (right) and East First Street (left).
Figure 10. Detail of the 1947 Sanborn Insurance Maps showing the mid-twentieth-century arrangement of structures within the Project Area.
Figure 11. Site plan depicting the locations of archeological test trenches within Block 457, Lot 28; photographic views are indicated by Photograph Number.
Figure 12. Trench 1, north wall profile, 0–20 feet east from Extra Place.

Trench 1
North Wall Profile

- asphalt paving
- brownstone sill
- concrete structural brace
- west foundation wall
- cement or concrete floor of basement

1. 10YR 4/2 dark grayish brown loamy clean fill with crushed stone
2. 5YR 4/2 dark reddish gray loam fill with brick rubble and demolition debris
3. 5YR 6/3 light reddish brown brick rubble and demolition debris
Figure 13. Trench 2, north wall profile, 0–85 feet east from Extra Place.
Figure 14. Trench 3 east wall profile.

- I 10YR 4/2 dark grayish brown loam fill with crushed stone
- II 5YR 4/2 dark reddish gray loam fill with brick rubble and demolition debris
- III 5YR 6/3 light reddish brown brick rubble and demolition debris
- IV 7.5YR 6/4 light brown sand fill with brick rubble
- V 10YR 3/3 dark brown streaked with 10YR 5/6 yellowish brown loam fill with ash, mortar, and 19th Century artifacts
- VI 10YR 7/3 very pale brown sand, mortar, and cinders with bands of 10YR 4/1 dark gray ash
- VII 5YR 4/4 reddish brown sand with gravel, pebbles, and cobbles (glacial subsoil)
Photographs
Photograph 1. Existing conditions within the Project Area at the time of the Phase 1B investigation; view to the northeast.

Photograph 2. Existing conditions within the Project Area at the time of the Phase 1B investigation; view to the east.
Photograph 3. Excavation of demolition debris and brick rubble in Trench 1; view to the east.
Photograph 4. Demolition debris and fill deposits in the east wall profile of Trench 1; view to the east.
Photograph 5. Brick foundation wall segments and structural beams in Trench 2; view to the east.
Photograph 6. Brick foundation wall segments in Trench 2; view to the west.
Photograph 7. Brick rubble in back-dirt pile during the excavation of Trench 2; view to the northeast.
Photograph 8. Trench 3 at the close of test excavations; view to the west.

Photograph 9. Sample of ceramic sherds recovered from Trench 3, Stratum V (Appendix A: Catalog #2).
Photograph 10. Sample of glass fragments recovered from Trench 3, Stratum V (Appendix A: Catalog #2).

Photograph 11. Demolition debris and brick rubble in Trench 4; view to the northeast.
Photograph 12. Demolition debris and brick rubble in Trench 5; view to the east.
Photograph 13. Brick foundation wall sections and demolition debris in Trench 6; view to the south.
Photograph 14. Demolition rubble in the west wall profile of Trench 6; view to the west.
Photograph 15. Sample of ceramic sherds recovered from Trench 6, Stratum III (Appendix A: Catalog #3).

Photograph 16. Sample of glass bottles recovered from Trench 6, Stratum III (Appendix A: Catalog #3).
Appendix A:
Artifact Inventory
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CAT#</th>
<th>COUNT</th>
<th>ARTIFACT DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>EMBOSSE/MASER'S MARK</th>
<th>COMMENTS</th>
<th>DATE RANGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 2    | 2     | Flat Glass: Privacy             |                      | [\[A: Arfiract Calal0l!:
| 1    | 1     | Hard-Paste Porcelain: Hotel Ware|                      | [Block 457, Lot 28, New York, NY
| 1    | 1     | Domestic Gray Stoneware: Plain Salt Glass|                   | [Phase I B Archeoioglli Invulif;ation
| 1    | 1     | Domestic Gray Stoneware: Gray Salt Glass|                   | [John Milner Associates, Inc. - .Inly
| 2    | 1     | Domestic Gray Stoneware: Slip Glass|                   | [2005
| 2    | 1     | Industrial Stoneware Bottle: British Brown| \["P...J. ARNOL.../LONDON/ENGLAND"
| 2    | 1     | White Stoneware: Sponge Decorated|                      | [ink bottle base; "P.J. Arnold's Writing Fluid"
| 2    | 1     | Whiteware: Sponge Decorated     |                      | [cloudy blue decorative motif
| 2    | 34    | Ironstone: Plain White          |                      | [hollowware fragment
| 2    | 1     | Ironstone: Plain White          |                      | [miscellaneous sherd representing indeterminate number of vessels
| 2    | 3     | Ironstone: Gilded               |                      | [partial maker's mark: "Semi Vitraceous Porcelain,
| 2    | 3     | Ironstone: Molded               |                      | [United States Pottery Co., Wellsville, OH, U.S.A."
| 2    | 4     | Ironstone: Molded               |                      | [single gilded band
| 2    | 1     | Redware: Unglazed               |                      | [wheat pattern
| 2    | 1     | Yellowware: Plain               |                      | [scalloped edge
| 2    | 1     | Yellowware: Rockingham/Bennington|                   | [rimsherd; likely flowerpot
| 2    | 1     | Ricketts-Mold Bottle Fragment: Clear|                   | [molded rim sherd
| 2    | 6     | Embossed Glass Fragment: Cobalt Blue| \["...OR.../U... J...NTAINS ON..."
| 2    | 1     | Unidentified Bottle Fragment: Amber|                   | [base; very weathered
| 2    | 11    | Unidentified Bottle Fragment: Clear|                   | [neck and tooled finish
| 2    | 1     | Post-Mold Bottle Fragment: Aqua  |                      | [blue pen cap
| 2    | 1     | Writing, Plastic: Pen           |                      | [blue pen cap
| 3    | 2     | Hard-Paste Porcelain: Hotel Ware|                      | [base fragments holloware (salt-shaker)
| 3    | 2     | Ironstone: Plain White          |                      | [yellow
| 3    | 3     | 20th-Cent Refined Earthenware: Fiesta| \["GENUINE/FIESTA/... USA"
| 3    | 3     | 20th-Cent Refined Earthenware: Fiesta|                   | [flowerpot sherd; kitsch orange/black tiger-stripe motif
| 3    | 1     | Redware: Painted Decoration     |                      | [1836-1909
| 3    | 1     | Yellowware: Plain               |                      | [1936-1969
| 3    | 1     | Hinge-Buttom-Mold Bottle: Clear |                      | [1936-1969
| 3    | 1     | Machine-Made Bottle: Green      |                      | [1936-1969

Appenidix A: Page 1
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CAT#</th>
<th>COUNT</th>
<th>ARTIFACT DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>EMBOSSED/MAKER'S MARK</th>
<th>COMMENTS</th>
<th>DATE RANGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Machine-Made Bottle: Amber</td>
<td>&quot;ANCOSTURA AROMATIC BITTERS/5 l 73/&quot;</td>
<td>liquor bottle</td>
<td>1903-2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Machine-Made Bottle: Clear</td>
<td>&quot;GULDEN'S MUSTARD/REG.U.S.PAT OFF/BOTTLE/7/&quot;</td>
<td>condiment jar</td>
<td>1903-2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Machine-Made Bottle: Clear</td>
<td>&quot;504/P/1/&quot; [on base]</td>
<td>condiment bottle: hot sauce</td>
<td>1903-2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Machine-Made Bottle Fragment: Clear</td>
<td>&quot;7594/ROMA/WINES//ONE QUART/&quot;</td>
<td>wine bottle base</td>
<td>1903-2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Machine-Made Bottle Fragment: Clear</td>
<td></td>
<td>necks and lip (3 bottles)</td>
<td>1903-2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAT#</td>
<td>COUNT</td>
<td>Artifact Description</td>
<td>Embossing/Maker's Mark</td>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Date Range</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Machine-Made Bottle Fragment: Olive Green</td>
<td>&quot;BOTTLE MADE IN ENGLAND/JUSTERINI &amp; BROOKS LONDON ENGLAND&quot;</td>
<td>liquor bottle base/body</td>
<td>1903-2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Machine-Made Bottle Fragment: Dark Green</td>
<td>neck and lip</td>
<td>1903-2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Decorated/Embossed Glass Fragment: Clear</td>
<td>&quot;Cointreau&quot;</td>
<td>embossed liquor bottle fragment</td>
<td>1903-2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Unidentified Bottle Fragment: Milk Glass</td>
<td>base of rectangular bottle/jar</td>
<td>1743-2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Miscellaneous Glass Tableware: Molded Stemmed</td>
<td>stemware fragment: base</td>
<td>1743-2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Utensil, Metal: Table Knife</td>
<td>&quot;N.S. CO./STAINLESS&quot;</td>
<td>1743-2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Utensil, Metal: Table Fork</td>
<td>&quot;N.S. CO./STAINLESS&quot;</td>
<td>1743-2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Miscellaneous, Plastic: Other</td>
<td>enclosure/spout</td>
<td>1743-2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix B:
Inventory of Faunal Remains
### Appendix B: Inventory of Faunal Remains

Black 457, Lot 28, New York, NY
Phase 1B Archeological Investigation
John Milner Associates, Inc. - July 2005

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CAT#</th>
<th>SPECIES</th>
<th>ANATOMY</th>
<th>PART</th>
<th>COUNT</th>
<th>FRAG</th>
<th>SIDE</th>
<th>FUSION</th>
<th>BUTCHERY</th>
<th>CONDITION</th>
<th>COMMENT</th>
<th>WEIGHT (g)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Catalog #1, Trench 1, 80-85 feet E, Stratum II/III, Recovered from Back-dirt**

1. Pig Incisor-Low Whl 1 - - - - Young, Small - -

**Catalog #2, Trench 3, 130-140 feet E, Stratum V, 4-6 feet bgs**

2. Chicken Femur Mid 1 0.7 R Both Unfused - - - - 0.5
3. Clam Shell Whl 3 0.5 - - - - - - 165
2. Clam Shell Frag. - 1 - - - - - - -
2. Cow Carpal Whl 1 - - - - - - - 21
2. Large Mammal Long Bone Mid 2 0.2 - - Weathered - -
2. Large Mammal Rib/Vert - 1 0.2 - - Sawn Steak 14 mm - - 22
2. Large Mammal Rib Mid 1 0.5 - - Sawn Mid - - 10
2. Medium Bird Fragment - 2 0.2 - - - - - -
2. Pig Rib-Up Whl 1 0.7 - Px Unfused - - - - 12
2. Sheep/Goat Rib Prox 2 0.2 - - - - - - 3

**Catalog #3, Trench 6, 90-95 feet S, Stratum III, 2-4 feet bgs**

3. Chicken Femur Mid-Dist 1 0.2 - Unfused - Weathered Modern-Immature Size 2
3. Clam Shell Whl 2 0.5 - - - - 1 very weathered 64
3. Cow Rib-Mid Prox 1 0.5 - - Sawn Mid; Sawn V/D-Both 16.4 mm - - 66
3. Cow Vert. - 1 0.2 - - Sawn All Ways 16.4 mm - - -
3. Cow Rib-Mid Prox 1 0.5 - - Sawn Axial Iron Stain - - -