Landmarks Preservation Commission January 14, 1969, Calendar No. 1 LP-0250

ST. MARK'S HISTORIC DISTRICT, Borough of Manhattan.

The property bounded by the western property line of 21 Stuyvesant Street, Stuyvesant Street, the western property line of 42 Stuyvesant Street, the rear lot lines of 42 and 44 Stuyvesant Street, the eastern property lines of 44 and 46 Stuyvesant Street, Second Avenue, East 11th Street, the western property line of 232 East 11th Street, a portion of the rear lot line of 129 East 10th Street, the rear lot line of 127 East 10th Street, a portion of the western property line of 127 East 10th Street, the rear lot lines of 125 through 109 East 10th Street, the western property line of 109 East 10th Street, East 10th Street, the western property line of 106 East 10th Street, and the rear lot lines of 106 East 10th Street to the western property line of 21 Stuyvesant Street.

Om April 12, 1966, the Landmarks Preservation Commission held a public hearing on the proposed designation of the St. Mark's Historic District (Item No. 32). The hearing had been duly advertised in accordance with the provisions of law. Four witnesses spoke in favor of designation. There were no speakers in opposition to designation.

In recent years, a great deal of effort has gone into the rehabilitation of this area, and many residents and property owners there have urged the Commission to make this designation. Supporters of the proposed designation include St. Mark's Church In-the-Bowery and the owners of 123, 125, 127 and 129 East 10th Street and 108, 114, 118, 120 and 128 East 10th Street and 21, 23, 25, 27, 29, 31, 33, 35, 42 and 44 Stuyvesant Street.

HISTORY

Historically and architecturally, the St. Mark's Historic District is of great value to the City of New York. It is a fragment of mid-Nineteenth Century architecture, showing primarily the variations within the Italianate style but includes three of the earliest Federal buildings in Manhattan. Historically, it stretches back to Peter Stuyvesant, Director General of the West India Company in New Notherlands. He bought Bowery #1 on which was situated his home and part of Bowery #2, which became the nucleus of his holdings, from the West India Company March 12, 1651. (Bowery is an anglicization of the old Dutch word for farm). The lane that originally separated the two farms eventually became Stuyvesant Street.

These properties were ultimately bequeathed, (see Genealogy) but for a few exceptions, to the Director General's great-grandson, Petrus (1727-1805) who, in the Dutch style, used the Latin form of the name. It is during his lifetime that the story of this Historic District, as we see it today, begins.

The development was shaped primarily by two factors: 1. The provisions of the wills of the Stuyvesants. 2. The street patterns imposed on the Stuyvesant property.

Evert Bancker, Jr., surveyed and laid out Stuyvesant Street for Petrus Stuyvesant November 30, 1787 and, we assume, mapped a complete street plan through his property, squaring with the points of the compass. Stuyvesant Street actually runs due east and west. The present Manhattan grid pattern follows the axis of the Island. The streets running north and south were named for Petrus Stuyvesant's four daughters, Judith, Elizabeth, Margaret and Cornolia. The streets which ran parallel to Stuyvesant Street were, in order from north to south, Tenbroeck, Winthrop, Gerard, Governor, Peter, Stuyvesant, Nicholas William and Verplanck, and were named for male members of the family. Unfortunately the Bancker map cannot be found, but the street pattern has been recorded on the Goerck-Mangin Map, 1799, "which was drawn from actual survey," and a portion of it appears on the later William Bridges map 1807-1811. (Appendix "A")

At least as early as 1789, Petrus Stuyvesant had begun to lot his property. Again no map is available, but he refers in his will to lots as surveyed by Charles Loss (Will Liber 46, p. 107). Petrus Stuyvesant, as did others at this time (Aaron Burr, the Bayards and Trinity Church), began preparations, first, for increasing his income, and incidentally planning for the future pressures of urban expansion. (The Stuyvesants were land-poor at this time.)

Three Earliest Buildings Now Standing

Three important buildings stand from the lifetime of Petrus Stuyvesant. St. Mark's Church 1795-1799, for which he gave the land and \$800 towards its construction, and No. 21 Stuyvesant Street, 1803-1804, the home of his daughter Elizabeth Stuyvesant and her husband Nicholas Fish. These two buildings have already been designated as Landmarks by the Landmarks Preservation Commission and are covered in separate reports. The third building is No. 44 Stuyvesant Street, shown on the Bridges map as a free standing house at the then southwest corner of Stuyvesant and Judith Streets, opposite St. Mark's Church on the then northeast corner.

This house was erected in 1795 for Nicholas William Stuyvesant, who married Catherine Livingston Reade, January 31, 1795. They lived in this house for twentythree years until the death of his mother in 1818, when they moved into the "Bowery House".

Petrus Stuyvesant died in 1805 and by the provisions of his will (Will Liber 46, p. 107), left to his oldest son Nicholas William, the "Bowery House" and all the property south of Stuyvesant Street, and to Peter Gerard, "Petersfield" and all the land north of Stuyvesant Street, except the four houses in possession of his daughters.

The New York State legislature, April 3, 1807, appointed Commissioners to lay out a plan for the City of New York. The result is the "grid plan" we know today. William Bridges made the original survey and map 1807-1811. Although it was a number of years before the new street pattern was cut through (3rd Ave. in 1812, 2nd Avenue in 1816 and 8th - 12th Sts. in 1826) and imposed over the original street pattern, its impact was evident as soon as the surveyors set up their instruments. The consequences were as radical in their time as a large urban renewal project is today. The streets would have been closed, buildings moved, the land acquired by careful procedure, and the owners compensated for their losses, or assessed, if proximity to the new street increased the value of their property. The map of Nicholas William's property (346-A, Map Room, Registrar's Office), drawn in 1815, was planned to conform to the new street pattern. Incidentally, this map also shows 44 Stuyvesant Street. St. Mark's Church petitioned the legislature for permission to convey church-owned land to proprietors of adjoining lands, and to receive such lands, as the changes in the streets imposed a great hardship, because the present shape of the boundaries of the Church burying ground and parsonage were in fact abolished by the Act of April 3, 1807 (Liber 130 p. 519, June 17, 1818).

Stuyvesant Street was opened as a public street "both for Public convenience and for the accommodation of a large and respectable Congregation attending St. Mark's Church as well as the owners and occupants of several large and commodious dwelling houses . . . all of which would be destroyed, or rendered of little value, if that street were closed." (Minutes of the Common Council January 25, 1830)

The cutting through of Tenth Street in 1826 considerably reduced the size of the Fish property at 21 STuyvesant Street, and Peter Gerard Stuyvesant (who had inherited this piece of land under the terms of his father's will) conveyed a strip in 1828, and the rest of the triangular shaped gore lot at Stuyvesant and 10th Streets in 1834, to Elizabeth and Nicholas Fish (Liber 312-171) to compensate for the loss of their rear garden.

This gore lot, on which "The Triangle" would eventually be built, has popularly been known as "Elizabeth Fish's Gardens". Originally it was a rectangle of 150 x 200 feet and is probably the same land described in the 1808 tax assessment book as Peter Gerard Stuyvesant's garden. It was undoubtedly used by all the family who lived in Stuyvesant Street. Peter Gerard Stuyvesant moved into the house originally belonging to his sister Margaret, after he sold "Petersfield" and 200 lots for \$100,000 April 19, 1825. According to a reminiscence of Stuyvesant Fish, the garden contained flowers, two horse chestnut trees, berry bushes, a greenhouse, stable and the family cow, Emily. "Elizabeth Fish's Gardeh" and most of Tenth Street remained vacant land until after her death (September 16, 1854). It seems the family wished to retain the quiet environment of flfty years before, when she was married. In 1858 Matthias Banta bought the property for development.

The Stuyvesant Family

Except for the first Peter Stuyvesant, whose life has been both documented and romanticized by Walter Huston's singing of "September Song" in the musical show <u>Knickerbocker Holiday</u>, there is little published information about the succeeding generations of Stuyvesants. Very few family papers, if they exist, are available to the public. Gerardus was described "as a man of probity who was elected into the magistracy thirty years successively." Nicholas William was a merchant. Petrus served as a captain in the French War.

We know the most about Peter Gerard Stuyvesant. He was a founder of The New-York Historical Society. He gave the land for Stuyvesant Square and for St. George's Church. Undoubtedly, he and Thomas MacFarlan managed his estate with extraordinary judgment, for after Peter Gerard Stuyvesant drowned at Niagara Falls in 1847, Philip Hone reported he was the "wealthiest man in New York, after Astor." His will divided his estate among his nephews, Hamilton Fish and Gerard Stuyvesant, and his great grandnephew Stuyvesant Rutherford, who was five at the time, with the provision that his name be changed to Rutherford Stuyvesant, which was speedily done thereafter. The Rutherfords moved into Peter G. Stuyvesant's newly completed mansion on the West side of Second Avenue at 11th Street, and between 1853 and 1858 his father, Lewis Morris Rutherford, the noted astronomer, built an observatory there. The New York Times, of October 6, 1912, in a reminiscence about the house, said that up to that time the photographs of the moon taken by Rutherford had never been excelled.

They all served St. Mark's Church, and here eight generations, from the Director-General down to Augustus Van Horne Stuyvesant, the last of the line, are all buried. Standing within the Church and seeing Stuyvesant memorial plaques, windows and marked pews for members of the family, one feels the sense of history and the continuity of the family.

Even before the last house in this Historic District was completed, the surrounding blocks had begun to be used to house immigrants from Germany. Eventually this district sheltered succeeding waves of immigrants, crowding them into former single family houses. With a few exceptions, buildings in the District became rooming houses. Fortunately, within the last few years, the neighborhood has enjoyed a successful renaissance through the leadership of Lee Anderson and Davie Lerner.

DESCRIPTION OF THE BUILDINGS

STUYVESANT STREET (Between 2nd Avenue and East 9th Street)

With only three different houses on the south side within the Historic District, and a long, uniformly designed row of houses on the north side with only one house of different design, this attractive residential street is nevertheless a fine expression of diversity. It is unusual to find such a handsome group of houses, all executed in a uniform style of architecture as those which virtually fill the north side of the street.

An interesting contrast to this uniform brick row of Anglo-Italianate town houses, built in 1861, is the very early town house, at the west end of the row, built for a daughter of the Stuyvesant family in 1804. Beautifully preserved, with its original dormers, it was, when built, a tall house for its day. Today it is dwarfed by the five-story row to the east of it, an interesting visual commentary on the changes which our City underwent in a short half century.

The three houses on the south are small brick houses which, although altered and raised in height, are nonetheless much smaller than the apartment houses on either side of them which are outside the District. STUYVESANT STREET South Side (Between 2nd Avenue and East 9th Street)

#46

This handsome Anglo-Italianate town house with rusticated stone base and central entrance, just above street level, is three windows wide and has its upper floors of brick. It is constructed on a triangular-shaped gore lot.

The builder cleverly overcame the problem presented by the gore lot by placing the doorway in the center of the heavily rusticated English basement to make the best possible use of the awkwardly shaped interior of the house.

Nicholas William Stuyvesant divided his estate among his eight children, and lots 28 and 29 of his estate, now known as Numbers 42, 44 and 46 Stuyvesant Street, were awarded to his son, Robert Reade Stuyvesant.

In 1834 Robert died, intestate, at the age of 23 with his widow, Margaret as sole survivor. She executed an agreement with the sons and sons-in-law of Nicholas W. Stuyvesant, in which she released her dower right in Robert's share of his father's estate (the sons and sons-in-law doubted the validity of her claim) for an annual income of \$2,327. It was equivalent to a 6% return on 1/3 of the productive value of Robert's share of his father's estate. Robert's share reverted to his father's estate. (Convey. Liber 403, p. 161; Convey. Liber 344, p. 570, May 1, 1835).

Within the month, May 19, 1835, the heirs of Nicholas William Stuyvesant sold lots 28 and 29 and two others to Henry Dudley (one of the sons-in-law) for \$19,000. Dudley sold the lots to Thomas E. Davies (a large scale builder and executor) on Feb. 22, 1837 (Liber 375, p. 36).

To settle the mortgage claims of Walton Peckham against Davies, they were sold at auction to the highest bidder, James Hooker, and conveyed to him by Philo Ruggles, Master-in-Chancery, January 21, 1840, for \$10,500 (Liber 404, p. 280). Hooker, in turn, sold only lots 28 and 29 on November 2, 1844 to Daniel Kingsland for \$5,500 (Liber 451, p. 628). The dizzying speculation in New York real estate before the Panic of 1837, and the slow recovery, can be traced in the sale prices for these lots.

In 1853 John L. Smith, builder, acquired the gore lot at No. 46 from David Kingsland for \$1,250. (Liber 652, p. 132). The conveyance gave Smith the right to insert beams in the east gable of No. 44 Stuyvesant Street and to use that wall as a party wall. The building was sold by Smith to Samuel Elliott, oculist, for \$10,700, on April 1, 1854, (Liber 659, p. 283).

#44

This early Federal house was erected in 1795 for Nicholas William Stuyvesant on Stuyvesant Street. It may once have had a roof with dormers.

Examination of the facade substantiates a construction date, late in the Eighteenth Century. The almost square windows, splayed lintels and brick laid in Flemish bond are characteristics of that period. The dressed brown-stone at the basement displays construction of superior quality. The door-way has retained its original proportions, indicating the grand style of the door which has been replaced.

At the top floor the front windows were replaced and the skylight was added during reconstruction after a fire. Handsome wrought-iron handrailings flank the stoop.

Surviving interior elements consist of hand-hewn beams, a dog-leg staircase starting from the second floor, the handsome stair railing, shutters, doors, chimney pieces and base boards, designed in an early Federal adaptation of the Adam style, thus indicating a late Eighteenth Century building.

The chimney pieces have double colonnettes at each side, and the frieze is ornamented with figures in gesso. The motif on the baseboard, reeding alternating with rosettes, is similar to a design sketched by Samuel McIntire, from Bulfinch's Barrell House in Boston, 1792 (Samuel McIntire, a Bicentennial Symposium, 1757-1957, Plate 24, Avery Library). #44 The rear exterior construction also indicates a late Eighteenth Century Cont. date. The basement wall is constructed of stone blocks, and the basement windows were once surrounded by stone quoins. (These have been replaced by brick, but the pattern survives). The documentation supplements the architectural details of the building and points to a construction date of 1794-95. The tax assessment on Nicholas William Stuyvesant's property was increased from \$160 in 1794 to \$400 in 1795. It was on January 31, 1795 that Nicholas William married Catherine Livingston Reade.

The couple lived twenty-three years in this elegant and spacious house, raising their family of six sons and three daughters. By the terms of his father's will, Nicholas William inherited the Bowery house, his father's residence, but Petrus Stuyvesant had given the use of this house, and a portion of surrounding land, to his widow during her lifetime.

Promptly upon the death of his mother in 1818, Nicholas William Stuyvesant moved into "Bowery House" and rented No. 44 Stuyvesant Street. It continued to be rented during his life. The remodeling of the parlor floor, an exceptionally fine example of the later Federal style, dates from 1832.

It is impossible to over-emphasize the importance of this building historically and architecturally. It is one of only two remaining houses of the early generations of the Stuyvesant family, and it is that family name, above all others, that represents Dutch New York.

Architecturally it is important if only as an addition to the surviving handful of late Eighteenth Century houses. With the exception of the Jumel Mansion and Dyckman farmhouse, it is the only building from that century, which has been solely used for residential use, successfully retaining for over 175 years its original plan (which is two rooms off the hall) and its many architectural elements.

#42

In 1845 Daniel Kingsland build No. 42 Stuyvesant Street as a $2\frac{1}{2}$ story house in the Greek Revival style. The building still retains some of its original flavor, although the ground floor was remodeled in 1915 (BD Alt. 966-1915), and the skylight was added in 1950 (BD Alt. 827-1950). He was assessed for \$3,500 in 1845, but in 1846 it was an empty lot, assessed to J. R. Stuyvesant for \$1,700.

STUYVESANT STREET North Side (Between East 10th and East 9th Streets)

#21

Twenty-One Stuyvesant Street is a brick Federal style residence with three full floors and an attic. In its architecture, the Stuyvesant-Fish House displays beauty of proportion, notable restraint and those details that indicate an outstanding Federal house. Inside the building many original features have survived testifying to its authenticity - the stairway, the archway in the hall, ceiling decorations and the side windows that were used when the house was first built and had no adjoining building to the east. The exterior of 21 Stuyvesant Street is a hallmark of the Federal style; above the windows are the original splayed stone lintels. On the top floor of the house are two early arched dormer windows; at the center of each arch is a double keystone and the top sash has been replaced. The Stuyvesant-Fish House stands today as an all but unique example of a fine New York urban dwelling of the period.

"Elizabeth Fish's Garden," and most of Tenth Street remained vacant land until after her death (Sept. 16, 1854). It seems the family wished to retain the quiet environment of fifty years before when she moved to Stuyvesant Street as the bride of Nicholas Fish.

The house at No. 21 Stuyvesant Street, is rich in historical association. Petrus Stuyvesant built this house in 1804 for his daughter Elizabeth, at the time of her marriage to Nicholas Fish. Fish served at Valley Forge and throughout the Revolutionary War. He was commissioned a Major at the age of eighteen and is believed to have been the youngest Major in the history of the United States Army. He was a close friend of Alexander Hamilton and was also an intimate friend of General Lafayette, who was entertained at 21 Stuyvesant Street on the evening of September 10, 1824, during his famous return to America, 50 years after the Revolutionary War. Nicholas Fish's son, Hamilton, was born at No. 21 Stuyvesant Street in 1808. Hamilton Fish served as Governor of New York, as United States Senator, and for eight years as Secretary of State. #23-35

"The Triangle" which extends around into East 10th Street (Nos. 112-128) consists of the following buildings on Stuyvesant Street:

23 Stuyvesant Street, completed 1861, Solomon Banta, \$6,000.
25 Stuyvesant Street, completed 1861, S. Young 6,000.
27 Stuyvesant Street, completed 1861, Samuel Adams Matthias Eanta 6,000.
29 Stuyvesant Street, completed 1861, Est. J. A. Aguillar 7,000.
31 Stuyvesant Street, completed 1861, Abendroth Bros. 6,500.
33 Stuyvesant Street, completed 1861, Matthias Banta McMaster
35 Stuyvesant Street, completed 1861, Matthias Banta 6,000.

Elizabeth Stuyvesant Fish willed (Liber 110, p. 411 probated Sept. 26, 1854), after certain bequests, that the residue of her estate be divided equally among her four children, Hamilton Fish, Susan LeRoy, Elizabeth Morris and Margaret Neilson. Gerard W. Morris, Anthony Bleecker and Thomas MacFarlan were named the partitioners by her will, and the executors would hold the daughter's shares in trust. As part of his share Hamilton Fish received the house at No. 21 Stuyvesant Street and the adjoining property on Tenth Street. Each of the daughters received a portion of the garden which the Commissioners, in Partition, conveyed to the trustee, Hamilton Fish on November 9, 1854 as mapped, Oct. 14, 1854 by Thomas Ludlam (Conveyance, Liber 679, p. 33).

The trustee, Hamilton Fish, on August 1, 1858 conveyed the property to Mathias Banta, counselor-at-law for \$35,000, receiving \$13,351.85 for Elizabeth Morris, \$9,981.48 for Susan LeRoy, and \$11,666.67 for Margaret Neilson (Convey. Liber 780, p. 296, p. 299, p. 303). The conveyance stipulated that there was to be built upon the land "no brewery, distill=" ery, slaughter house, blacksmith shop, forge, furnace, soap, candle, starch, varnish, vitriol, glue, ink or turpentine factory, or any factory for tanning, dressing, or preparing skins, hides or leather, or any cow or livery stable or cattle yard, or any other dangerous, noxious or offensive establishments whatsoever, or any houses generally known as tenement house, or any other stable of any kind."

By March 28, 1859, Mathias Banta had had the property surveyed and lotted (Banta's lots were imposed on those partitioned for the Fish daughters, which accounts for the irregularities of certain rear lot lines and determined the dimensions of the houses laid out by James E. Serrel, CS.) (Map 609 Map Room, Hall of Records). He also arranged for mortgages on each lot from the Institution of Savings of Merchant Clerks or the Broadway Savings Institution. (Liber 750, p. 541 and Liber 783 p. 240.)

On March 28, 1859 a very modest advertisement was run in the New York Times and New York Herald as follows: "For sale, several very desirable new houses situated on the south side of Tenth Street between Second and Third Avenues. Apply to Thomas MacFarlan & Sons, 180 Tenth Street, near Third Avenue." The advertisement only ran for several days and was highly effective for most of the lots were sold within a few months for prices ranging from \$7,800 to \$13,250 depending on the lot and the projected size of the house. A comparison of the buyers, with their addresses in the city directory of the period, indicates the properties were purchased for investment by the new owners rather than as their residences. Mathias Banta himself did not move to No. 23 Stuyvesant Street, from East 90th Street, until 1365. Construction was begun in the spring of 1859, the lot assessment records of that year saying, for the Group on Stuyvesant Street, "7 lots in progress," but they were not recorded as completed and fully assessed until 1861.

The design of this group forming "The Triangle," in the Anglo-Italianate style with pressed brick and stone, has been attributed to James Renwick, Jr. No documentation has been found in confirmation of this, or crediting any other architect with the design. Whether or not Renwick was the architect should neither increase nor decrease the importance of this group of buildings, for it is the outstanding quality of the buildings themselves that earns them their recognition (Appendix "B"). #23-35 Visually the group should be considered as a single building designed Cont. in the grand manner, instead of two rows of small houses on a triangular shaped lot. This is the success of the design because looking at the rows, it is difficult to distinguish the individual houses. The treatment of the prow or point of this site, truncated or cut off instead of following the lot lines to a point, creates the main feature of the design. This end feature is emphasized by being faced with stone instead of brick, by having the corners finished with vermiculated quoins, and by having bay windows. Special note should be taken of the rusticated basement with vermiculation used for contrast and of the different, yet harmonious, window treatments of the five stories.

This triangular shaped group of buildings is in an excellent state of preservation. The original iron balconies at the parlor floor level are gone, and other ironwork is missing, but a complete set of handrailings survives at 128 East 10th Street. With these minor exceptions, the buildings stand today much as they were when completed in 1861.

EAST TENTH STREET (Between 2nd and 3rd Avenues)

A general appearance of uniformity, particularly that of height, manifests itself on both sides of this street. The handsome "Triangle", which also extends around into Stuyvesant Street, gives the south side an air of uniform elegance, such as is rarely to be found. Adjoining it, to the west, are three more Italianate houses of approximately the same height which, although lacking the rusticated "English basements" of "The Triangle", maintain the dignified air of this purely residential street.

On the north side a note of variety appears in the middle of the block, where an apartment house of the late eighteen-nineties rises well above the general cornice line of the adjoining residences. It not only rises above them but is set forward from the building line of its neighbors on either side.

To the east of the apartment house, four houses fill the space between it and the church-yard. Paired architecturally, the two nearest to it are an architectural treasure of Anglo-Italianate design, complete with rusticated "English basements" and cast iron balconies at the parlor floor.

To the west of the apartment house stands one fine old mansion and, to the west of it, a row of houses which have been combined, at a later date, to form what appears to be one long building. This long building, as seen today, is a part of the street scene which is typical of so many alterations throughout the City and also of Tenth Street. Lacking the greater architectural distinction of its neighbors it does, nonetheless, conform to them with regard to its scale and the spacing of its windows. Thus, it harmonizes well with those other parts of the street which best express the charm of the District.

EAST TENTH STREET South side (Between 2nd and 3rd Avenues)

#112-128

"The Triangle", which extends around into Stuyvesant Street (Nos. 23-35), consists of the following buildings on East Tenth Street:

128	(orig.	198)	Ε.	10th	St.,	completed	1861,	James Sinclair	\$7,000.
	(orig.					5.5	8 9	James Sinclair	6,000.
124	(orig.	194)	Ε.	10th	St.,	? ?	93	Frederick Hood	6,000.
122	(orig.	192)	Ε.	10th	St.,	ile e	88	J. R. Mott	5,600.
	(orig.					19	\$ 8	James Sinclair	5,800.
	(orig.					ę i		lvan Keyser	
	U							William Berrien	5,800.
116	(orig.	186)	Ε.	10th	St.,	11	79	James Stewart	5,800.
	(orig.					# #	9 1	Joan S. Howell	6,000.
	(orig.					81	29	Josiah Burton	
	5							Mathias Banta	6,500.

#112-128 The foregoing text for "The Triangle" on Stuyvesant Street is also Cont. applicable to these similar buildings on East 10th Street which form a part of it. Note the new facade at No. 112 of 1927 (BD Alt. 1427/27). Banta had conveyed these properties to the above owners prior to 1861, but for some reason, he continued to pay the taxes.

> These three identical houses were built in 1867 for James Mulry. In 1867 these three lots were assessed as part of Hamilton Fish's property at No. 21 Stuyvesant Street. They were designed in a late version of the Italianate style by D. & J. Jardine, architects. The segmental-arched doorways have stone cornice-slabs supported on vertical console brackets which, in turn, are carried on paneled pilasters. They are four stories high, above a basement, and all retain their stoops. They are all three surmounted by individual bracketed cornices which are aligned at the same level. The stone basement wall is carried up to sill height at the first floor with handsome recessed stone panels under each window.

> The lots for Numbers 106, 108 and 110 East 10th Street were inherited by Hamilton Fish from his mother's estate. He leased them, commencing May 1, 1867, for 21 years at the rental of \$200 each per year to James Mulry. The lease was subject to renewal at future 21 year intervals and carried, in addition, the restriction on dangerous, noxious or offensive establishments. If this were violated, not only would owners of adjoining property have the right to take action, but also owners whose property derive from Hamilton Fish or Peter G. Stuyvesant. In addition, the conveyance stipulates that the whole front thereof (lots) be covered by "a good and substantial dwelling house, three or more stories high, but not to be of the class or description commonly known as tenement houses 'or' community houses", to be constructed of brick or stone and to be covered with slate or metal. (Convey. Liber 1087 pp. 280, 285, 291)

How Mulry carried out the provisions of the lease is recorded on his application to the building department and by the buildings themselves. His application (N.B. 943-1867) was filed for three one-family dwellings, four stories, basement, and sub-cellar, at an estimated cost of \$6,000 each. With only minor changes (the replacement of the ironwork at all of the buildings and the windows at No. 108), the houses stand today much as designed.

EAST TENTH STREET North side (Between 2nd and 3rd Avenues)

#109-117

#106-110

This row of similar houses, with its windows aligned, has been visually combined together by being painted white. The only difference is that Numbers 109 through 113 have a common parapet, while Nos. 115 and 117 have cornices. The entrances are now at No. 111 and No. 117.

Numbers 109-115 were built in 1856 for Miller & Giles and were assessed at \$7,000 apiece. No. 117 was also built in 1856 for James Thorburn and was assessed similarly at \$7,000.

In 1855, Numbers 109-117 East 10th Street were four empty lots belonging to Hamilton Fish, assessed at \$3,000 each and about 26 feet wide. The lots had been awarded to Fish by the partition of Peter Gerard Stuyvesant's Estate (Liber 1109, p. 486, Map dated Oct. 24, 1848).

The stoops at 109, 111 and 113 East 10th Street were removed in 1919 by St. Mark's Church (B.D. Alt. 2114-1919), and these buildings are now served by a single basement entry. In spite of this change and the removal of the roof cornices and lintels, the buildings retain their original size and scale. The addition of the continuous simple iron railing at the first floor level, harmonizes with the block.

- #109-117 Numbers 115 and 117 were more fortunate in the alterations to their facades. The stoops were removed and a basement entry was introduced. The handsome cast iron balconies at the parlor floor windows and the cornices remain to establish the original Italianate style of these two buildings.
- #119 This fine Greek Revival house was built in 1845 for Joseph Russell and was assessed at \$7,000. It has a handsome stone doorway with "eared" frame surmounted by a cornice. The original door has been replaced by double doors in the Italianate style, surrounded by a rope molding. The stoop, with its original handrailings, remains in place. In 1844 this property was an empty lot assessed to Peter Gerard Stuyvesant for \$2,600.

Six stories high above a basement, this transitional apartment building displays Romanesque Revival arched windows and door at the first floor and the Neo-classic influence above, with pedimented windows and a cornice carried on horizontal console brackets. It was built for Augustus Ruff and was designed by Kurtzer & Rohl, architects, in 1899 at an estimated cost of \$20,000 (BD or B 949-1899).

This pair of brick Anglo-Italianate town-houses, with entrances just above grade and rusticated stone "English Basement", is exceptionally handsome and unchanged from the day it was built in 1854 for Robert Carnley. Each house was assessed at \$5,000. the first floor has round-arched doors and windows, while the windows above are all segmental arched with corniced lintels. The drawing room windows extend to the floor and open upon an ornamental cast iron balcony of the same design as those at the low stoops and at the areaways. A simple bracketed roof cornice crowns the houses effectively. In 1853 the property consisted of one empty lot, assessed at \$3,000 and belonging to Robert Carnley.

When Peter Gerard Stuyvesant sold the lots for 121, 123 and 125 East 10th Street to Robert Carnley, April 1, 1842 for \$3,125 (Liber 425, p. 259), the conveyance also stipulated that there was to be built upon the land no brewery, distillery, slaughter house, blacksmith shop, forge, furnace, soap, candle, starch, varnish, vitriol, glue, ink or turpentine factory, or any or livery stable, or cattle yard or any other dangerous noxious or offensive establishment for 20 years. Usually this type of covenant carried in perpetuity.

#127-129

#121

#123-125

After East Tenth and Eleventh Streets were opened in 1826, Peter Gerard Stuyvesant sold these two and the two adjoining lots on Eleventh Street for \$4,000 to Reverend William Creighton, the Rector of St. Marks, 1816-1836 (Convey. Liber 219, p. 29). The price quadrupled to \$16,000 when Reverend Creighton sold the same property to George Farrar, Feb. 1, 1853 (Convey. Liber. 632, p. 353). Farrar very shortly afterward sold to Bartolome Blanco at a profit of \$600 (Convey. Liber. 632, p. 366) and in June 1853 Blanco sold 23 feet of the frontage to Ida Harriott Mason for \$7,110 (Convey. Liber 638, p. 344).

The stoops of both buildings had been removed by 1903, when the New York Mission and Tract Society connected the interiors to provide housing facilities for the mission workers serving the neighborhood (Building Department Alt. 688-1903). Although this Building Department application does not specifically include this information, the Federal style lintels on the east side of the building were probably added at that time. The application does cite changes in the basement windows on this side. #127-129

The original door and doorway remain at No. 129 East 10th Street, although it was altered to a window above the basement entry. Both (Cont.) doorways were designed in a transitional style from Greek Revival to Italianate. The brownstone enframement is essentially Greek Revival, but the door itself, the rope molding and paneled pilasters are in the later style.

> St. Mark's Church acquired these two buildings, May 27, 1933, No. 127 by purchase for \$24,000 from the New York Mission and Tract Society (Convey. Liber 225, p. 422, Section 2) and No. 129 as a gift from Anna Bliss (Liber 225, p. 216). By 1919 the houses were operated as a residence club, called the Petrus Stuyvesant Club. (This was granted a C.O. 1344-1922 for studio rooms and club rooms.) Numbers 123-125, 119, 113, III, 109 E. 10th Street (also owned by St. Mark's Church) eventually were remodeled into studio rooms, in the early 1920's, as an adjunct to the Petrus Stuyvesant Club.

Two further notes are of special interest about 129 East 10th Street. The index of American Design in the 1930's recorded by measured drawing, details of the parlor floor as excellent examples of the Italianate style. In a speech on February 4, 1862 to The New-York Historical Society, Benjamin Winthrop, son of Judith Stuyvesant Winthrop, said that part of the foundation of Director General Peter Stuyvesant's house was found, when the site for No. 129 East 10th Street was excavated.

These houses were built in 1854 for John Harriott (No. 127) and for Bartolome Blanco (No. 129). No. 127 was assessed for \$10,000 at the time it was built and No. 129 for \$12,000.

STUYVESANT STREET North side (Between 2nd Avenue and East 10th Street)

Saint Marks-in-the-Bowery is a church which represents construction over a considerable period of time. The main body of the church, with its fieldstone walls and handsomely trimmed round arched windows, belongs to the late Georgian tradition. The steeple is pure Greek Revival and is beautifully, although simply, detailed. The dignified porch is of cast iron and belongs to the Italianate tradition of the mid-Nineteenth Century. What is most remarkable, in the case of this church, is the fact that elements of such diverse periods should harmonize so well, achieving a singularly attractive whole.

Historically, this is one of the outstanding churches of New York City, being the oldest site of worship in Manhattan, It is built on the site of Governor Stuyvesant's "Bouwerie", or farm, and reputedly covers the exact spot of ground occupied by his "Bouwerie Chapel". Under this church lies the famed Stuyvesant Vault wherein are interred the remains of Peter Stuyvesant, his heirs, and of the English Governor, Sloughter.

The old chapel was built in 1660, and Governor Peter Stuyvesant was buried in its graveyard, when he died in 1672. When Stuyvesant's widow died in 1692, she offered the chapel to the Dutch Reformed Church. In 1793 Petrus Stuyvesant gave the land, and a sum of money, to the Episcopal Church to induce them to build a new church building on the site.

Accordingly, they built a church for which the cornectone was laid in 1795, the church being opened for worship in 1799. A steeple was added in 1828 and the <u>New York Mirror</u> for that year credits the design of this hand-some Greek Revival addition to the architect Martin Thompson.

In 1858 the dignified cast iron porch, which we see today, was added although an earlier proposal for a porch had been made. The architect, A. J. Davis had made a drawing of the church, c. 1836, showing the Greek Revival steeple and a proposal for the addition of an lonic, hexastyle portico which was never built. In the eighteen thirties, the handsome iron railing surrounding the churchyard was erected.

#232

The Rectory of St. Mark's Church is a handsome two-story building of brick with a high metal roof, adorned with circular and rectangular shaped dormer windows. The broad windows on the three exposed sides have three-centered arches with keystoned lintels at the second floor and are segmental-arched at the first floor. A handsome porch, at the first floor level, faces the rear of the church on the east side of the house. The Rectory was designed by Ernest Flagg, the noted architect, at an estimated cost of \$14,000 (NB 93/1900). It stands on a lot, part of which was the St. Mark's Graveyard. Sixteen feet, eight inches of the frontage was purchased from Samuel and Claudia Stone for \$13,600, Nov. 24, 1899 (Liber 72, Section 2, p. 480).

FINDINGS AND DESIGNATIONS

On the basis of a careful consideration of the history, the architecture and other features of this area, the Landmarks Preservation Commission finds that the St. Mark's Historic District contains buildings and other improvements which have a special character and special historical and aesthetic interest and value and which represent one or more periods or styles of architecture typical of one or more eras in the history of New York City and which cause this area, by reason of these factors, to constitute a distinct section of the City.

The Commission further finds that, among its important qualities, The St. Mark's Historic District is a residential area notable for the quality and variety of its architecture, that it represents one of the oldest developments of this part of the City and has its own street pattern, that it occupies the site of Governor Stuyvesant's famous "Bouwerie" of farm, and has many associations with the Stuyvesant family, that while retaining two Federal town houses and a fine eighteenth-century church it is representative of the best architecture produced in the mid-Nineteenth Century in the Italianate style, that it has retained much of its original character and that in the heart of our City it represents a residential area of exceptional charm and historic significance.

Accordingly, pursuant to the provisions of Chapter 63 of the Charter of the City of New York and Chapter 8-A of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, the Landmarks Preservation Commission designates as a Historic District the St. Mark's Historic District, Borough of Manhattan, consisting of the property bounded by the western property line of 21 Stuyvesant Street, the rear lot lines of 42 and 44 Stuyvesant Street, the eastern property lines of 44 and 46 Stuyvesant Street, Second Avenue, East 11th Street, the western property line of 232 East 11th Street, a portion of the rear lot line of 129 East 10th Street, the rear lot line of 127 East 10th Street, a portion of the western property line of 127 East 10th Street, the rear lot lines of 125 through 109 East 10th Street, the western property line of 106 East 10th Street, East 10th Street, the western property line of 106 East 10th Street, and the rear lot lines of 106 East 10th Street, the western property line of 21 Stuyvesant Street. BIBLIOGRAPHY

Fish, Stuyvesant, <u>An Address Delivered at the Annual Meeting of the Order</u> of Colonial Lords of Manors in America, 1930.

Harlow, Alvin F., Old Bowery Days, 1931.

Harpers Weekly, Dec. 9, 1893, p. 1160.

Macfarlan, Thomas, letterbook, 1843-50.

Minutes of the Common Council of the City of New York, 1784-1831.

Nevins, Allan, <u>Hamilton Fish</u>.

New York City, Directories.

Stokes I. N. Phelps, The Iconography of Manhattan Island, 1915-1928.

Stuyvesant. Family, manuscripts, The New-York Historical Society.

Stuyvesant, Augustus Van Horne, Jr., papers, The New-York Historical Society.

Credits: The staff of The New-York Historical Society for their kind assistance, and Mr. V. Maguire, of the United States Trust Co., in connection with the papers of the late Augustus Van Horne Stuyvesant, Jr.

APPENDIX A

We do not know how much of the street plan was actually put into effect. The Goerck-Mangin Map, 1799, published by Peter Maverick, New York, 1803, included other proposed streets, such as South and West Streets. This may also be true of the section of the map that describes the Stuyvesant property. The Bridges Map shows Stuyvesant Street running to the East River; Nicholas William, Verplanck, Peter and Governor Streets running just to Judith Street; Judith Street to "Bowery House"; Gerard Street to Eliza Street, and Eliza Street running between Gerard and Stuyvesant Streets. (City of New York and Island of Manhattan as laid out by Commissioners appointed by the Legislature, April 3, 1807, William Bridges, City Surveyor. Engraved by P. Maverick, 1811). Docu-` ments of the period mention Stuyvesant, Peter, and Eliza Streets (Conveyance of burying ground to St. Mark's, Liber 71, p. 362, Nov. 10, 1803). Property owners on Verplanck, Nicholas William, Stuyvesant and Peter Streets, were assessed in condemnation records for the opening of Third Avenue, 1812.

APPENDIX B

Solomon Banta, father of Matthias Banta, was a masonry contractor, and it can safely be assumed was responsible for the splendid masonry of this group of buildings. <u>The Architects and Mechanics Journal</u>, published in New York, 1859-61, does not mention an architect for "The Triangle".

Banta worked with Renwick on the Albemarle Hotel and a warehouse on 38th Street and for John B. Snook and Robert Mook, popular architects of the time.

		Petrus Stuyvesant 1602-1687 Director General						
		Nicholas William 1648-1698 Gerardus 1691-1777						
Nicholas William 1722-1780 unmarried	Petrus 1727-1805 m. Margaret Livingston							
	ia 1768-1825 ock Ten Broeck	Nicholas William 1769-1833 m. 1795 Catharine L. Reade	Margaret 1772-1824 unmarried	Elizabeth 1775-1854 m. 1803 Col. Nicholas Fish	Peter Gerard 1777-1847 m. Helen Rutherford He had no children			
Elizabeth Winthrop m. John Chanler		8 Children including Gerard 1806-1859 m. Susan Van Horne		Hamilton Fish				
Margaret Chanler m. L. M. Rutherford	Augustus Van Horne Stuyvesant							
Stuyvesant Rutherford born 1842. Changed name to Rutherford Stuyvesant		Augustus Van Horne Stuyvesant, Jr. (Last male of the name) died 1953						

This Stuyvesant genealogical chart is based on Spooner's Historic Families in America, Vol. III. Other genealogies are in Robert W. G. Vail's Ancestral Record of the Family of Augustus Van Horne Stuyvesant, Jr. and in R. Van Rensselaer Stuyvesant's manuscript "Equestrian Instructions....plus a Stuyvesant Genealogy", both at the New-York Historical Society.