

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS  
OF  
PUBLIC REALM IMPROVEMENT FUND GOVERNING GROUP, INC.**  
*February 15, 2018*

The meeting of the Members and Directors of the East Midtown Public Realm Improvement Fund Governing Group was held at 3:41 p.m. on February 15, 2018 at 120 Broadway, New York, NY 10271.

Public notice of this meeting was given and posted in accordance with the Open Meetings Law.

The meeting was chaired by Council Member Powers, Vice-Chairperson of the Governing Group, on behalf of Deputy Mayor Alicia Glen, Chairperson of the Governing Group. The following Directors and Alternate Directors were present:

The following Members were present:

- Hon. Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President (arrived at 3:56 p.m., previously acting by proxy)
- Hon. Keith Powers, Council Member for District 4
- Dan Garodnick, Designee of Speaker of the Council
- Vikki Barbero, Chairperson and Designee of Manhattan Community Board Five
- Terrence O’Neal, Member and Designee of Manhattan Community Board Six
- Susan Chin, Executive Director of the Design Trust for Public Space

The following Members acted by proxy:

- Alicia Glen, Deputy Mayor of Housing and Economic Development
- Marisa Lago, Director of the NYC Department of City Planning
- James Patchett, President of the NYC Economic Development Corporation
- Polly Trottenberg, Commissioner of the NYC Department of Transportation
- Melanie Hartzog, Director of the NYC Office of Management and Budget
- Mitchell Silver, Commissioner of the NYC Department of Parks and Recreation
- Vincent Sapienza, Commissioner of the NYC Department of Environmental Protection

The following Directors and Alternate Directors were present:

- Hon. Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President (arrived at 3:56 p.m. and was preceded by her alternate director)
- Basha Gerhards, Alternate Director for the Manhattan Borough President
- Hon. Keith Powers, Council Member for District 4 (departed at 4:08 p.m. and replaced by his alternate director)
- Emily Walsh, Alternate Director for the Council Member for District 4
- Dan Garodnick, Designee of the Speaker of the Council

- Vikki Barbero, Chairperson and Designee of Manhattan Community Board Five
- Terrence O’Neal, Member and Designee of Manhattan Community Board Six
- Susan Chin, Executive Director of the Design Trust for Public Space
- Caitlin Lewis, Alternate Director for Deputy Mayor of Housing and Economic Development
- Bob Tuttle, Alternate Director for the Director of the Department of City Planning
- Ed Pincar, Alternate Director of the Department of Transportation
- James Katz, Alternate Director of the President of the Economic Development Corporation
- Nicholas Molinari, Alternate Director for the Commissioner of the Department of Parks and Recreation
- Michael DeLoach, Alternate Director for the Commissioner of the Department of Environmental Protection
- Stephen Malmberg, Alternate Director for the Director of the Office of Management and Budget

The Meeting of Members commenced, a quorum being present.

1. **Directors:** It was announced that elections were in order to elect Directors and Alternate Directors of the corporation. Hon. Mr. Powers added the election of James Katz, as Alternate Director for NYC Economic Development Corporation, to the agenda. There were no questions or comments. Upon a motion made and unanimously carried, a resolution was adopted for the membership sections at issue to elect the following Directors and Alternate Directors.

**Director:**

Keith Powers  
Daniel Garodnick  
Melanie Hartzog

**Alternate Director:**

Emily Walsh  
Marianna Vaidman Stone  
Stephen Malmberg  
James Katz

The Meeting of Directors commenced, a quorum being present.

1. **Adoption of Meeting Minutes:** It was announced that adoption of the meeting minutes from the Meeting of Members and Directors, held on November 20, 2017, was in order. Mr. O’Neal requested that the minutes clarify that the projects identified for further study were listed in no particular order. The addition was accepted. Upon a motion made and unanimously carried, the meeting minutes, modified as noted above, were adopted.
2. **Election of Vice-Chairperson:** It was announced that elections were in order to elect a Vice-Chairperson of the corporation. There were no questions or comments. Upon a motion made and unanimously carried, a resolution was adopted to elect the Hon. Mr. Powers, Council Member for District 4, as Vice-Chairperson.
3. **Audit Committee and Governance Committee:** It was announced that the appointment of members to the Audit Committee and Governance Committee were in order. There were no

questions or comments. Upon a motion made and unanimously carried, a resolution was adopted to appoint the following members to the Audit Committee and Governance Committee.

**Audit Committee:**  
Melanie Hartzog  
Keith Powers

**Governance Committee:**  
Melanie Hartzog

4. **Concept Plan Review Process and Community Board Priorities:** Ms. Lewis presented the process flow chart for selecting and implementing pedestrian realm improvement projects in the Concept Plan that includes the following key points:

- The Governing Group requests more information on a given project or set of projects in the Concept Plan.
- DOT and OMB conduct conceptual cost estimate and explore feasibility.
- The Governing Group will have the option to calendar a project for a funding vote. If a vote to calendar a project passes with only mayoral members of the Governing Group, the project requires a public hearing before it can be calendared. If a vote to calendar a project passes with one or more non-mayoral members, the project is calendared for the current meeting or a future meeting. Votes to calendar a project for the same meeting will be followed by a vote to fund the project.
- If approved, a project will begin the standard City agency approval process, including public outreach and a submission for scope of work and cost estimate to OMB.

Mr. O’Neal and Ms. Barbero provided an update regarding the joint Transportation Committee Meeting, which took place February 1, 2018, at which representatives from City Hall, DOT, and DCP presented the pedestrian realm improvements in the Concept Plan and answered Board Members’ questions. Following that meeting, each Community Board created a prioritized list of improvement projects.

Community Board 5 priorities:

1. Thoroughfare improvements on Lexington Avenue from 41st to 57th streets
2. A public plaza at Pershing Square East, from 41st to 42nd streets
3. A shared street along Vanderbilt Avenue, from 43rd to 47th streets
4. Thoroughfare improvements on Third Avenue from 41st to 57th streets
5. Thoroughfare improvements on Madison Avenue from 40th to 57th streets

Community Board 6 priorities:

1. Thoroughfare improvements on Lexington Avenue
2. A shared street along East 44th Street
3. A public plaza at Pershing Square East
4. Thoroughfare improvements on East 53rd Street
5. Thoroughfare improvements on Third Avenue
6. The security bollards for the shared street along East 43rd Street
7. A shared street along Vanderbilt Avenue

In answer to a question from Mr. Garodnick, Ms. Barbero and Mr. O’Neal confirmed that both Community Boards supported the addition of security bollards to the shared street along East 43rd Street.

5. **Concept Plan Project and Security Infrastructure Update:** DOT presented its findings related to the security infrastructure for the shared street along East 43rd Street and the five Concept Plan projects selected for further study during the November 20, 2017 meeting. DOT and OMB studied the scope of these projects with attention to costs, necessary security infrastructure, and general feasibility, including known underground infrastructure. Costs were escalated for a fiscal year 2022 construction year. The extent and estimated costs for the six projects are:

Public plaza at Pershing Square East for an estimated \$15 million

- Extent | Full street closure and plaza construction on east side of Park Avenue from East 41st to East 42nd streets
- Pedestrian plaza to be built-out at sidewalk grade
- Typical DOT public space elements to be included, such as benches, wayfinding, trees, and plantings where applicable
- Distinctive pavers, lighting, and other materials to be coordinated during design process
- K12 rated security devices<sup>1</sup> are at each end of the street closure and at each curb extension

Shared street along East 44th Street for an estimated \$15 million

- Extent | Along East 44th Street from Third to Lexington avenues
- East 44th Street will be designed to allow free movement of pedestrians, cyclists, and vehicles
- Design may include reduced speed limit, traffic calming, street furniture, landscaping, and geometric changes
- Typical DOT public space elements to be included, such as benches, wayfinding, trees, and plantings where applicable
- Basic DOT sidewalk and roadway materials
- K12 rated security devices located throughout the segment

Thoroughfare improvements on East 53rd Street for an estimated \$30 million

- Extent | Along East 53rd Street corridor between Third and Fifth avenues
- Permanent build-out of temporary materials (planned)
- Five curb extensions
- Three full block sidewalk extensions
- K12 rated security devices included at each curb extension

---

<sup>1</sup> A Department of State-certified barrier receives one of three K-level ratings (K4, K8, or K12) depending on its ability to successfully stop a vehicle with certain associated kinetic energy levels. A K12 rated bollard is designed to stop a vehicle weighing 15,000 lbs moving at a speed of 50 mph.

Thoroughfare improvements on Lexington Avenue for an estimated \$52 million

- Extent | Along Lexington Avenue from East 41st to East 57th streets
- Permanent build-out of temporary materials (planned)
- 29 curb extensions overall
- K12 rated security devices included at each curb extension

Shared street along Vanderbilt Avenue for an estimated \$62 million

- Extent | Shared street along Vanderbilt Avenue from East 43rd to East 47th streets, and pedestrian space improvements along East 43rd and 44th streets from Vanderbilt to Madison avenues
- Shared street will be designed to allow free movement of pedestrians, cyclists, and vehicles
  - Design may include reduced speed limit, traffic calming, street furniture, landscaping, and geometric changes
  - Typical DOT public space elements to be included, such as benches, wayfinding, trees, and plantings where applicable
  - Basic DOT sidewalk and roadway materials
- Along East 43rd and 44th streets there will be:
  - Sidewalk widening and full street reconstruction along both East 43rd and East 44th streets from Vanderbilt to Madison avenues
  - Four curb extensions along Vanderbilt Avenue at intersection with East 45th Street
  - Two additional curb extensions
- K12 rated security devices located throughout the shared street segment, and along each sidewalk widening and curb extension

Security infrastructure for the shared street along East 43rd Street for an estimated \$6.22 million

- Extent | Along East 43rd Street from Third to Lexington avenues, and pedestrian space improvements on Lexington Avenue at East 43rd and East 44th streets
- Additional funding is required to incorporate K12 rated security devices throughout the segment

The Hon. Ms. Brewer asked about the status of Pershing Square West. DOT responded that it would likely be complete in the spring of 2018. DOT noted that, by comparison, Pershing Square East should be completed more quickly than Pershing Square West due to the City's familiarity with the below-grade infrastructure. In response to a latter question from the Hon. Ms. Brewer, DOT responded that it would provide cost information for Pershing Square West at the next Governing Group meeting.

Ms. Lewis noted that City policy now requires public realm projects to include funding for security infrastructure. The Hon. Ms. Brewer asked whether the City could fund security measures for projects in East Midtown, rather than using the Public Realm Improvement Fund. Ms. Lewis replied that there is always the option for the City to budget for security measures. However, the request would be subject to the regular capital budgeting process and it could be years before the funding is available. She further explained that it is not

necessarily advantageous in the timeline of a project to separate out these costs.

In response to a question from Mr. Garodnick, Ms. Lewis and Mr. Pincar explained that without Governing Group funding for the security measures along the East 43rd Street shared street, the project would remain in interim materials until funding could be allocated through the City's capital budgeting process. DOT further noted that provisional security measures could be provided in the interim, such as jersey barriers or NYPD 'blocks'. This approach would be less permeable, be less visually appealing, require space for pedestrian use to be reallocated for security purposes, and not be rated to the K12 standard of bollards.

Ms. Chin suggested reallocating the DOT budget to fund security measures for improvements in East Midtown. Mr. Tuttle commented that the Greater East Midtown rezoning was designed to link private development with public realm improvements, something many neighborhoods are not able to accomplish. He further noted that the Governing Group is in a unique position in which future development will provide monetary contributions into the East Midtown Public Realm Improvement Fund. These resources will allow the Governing Group to fund projects on its own timeline without the need for City agencies to reallocate funds already earmarked for other projects.

Ms. Barbero asked about the difference in cost for security measures between Pershing Square East and East 43rd Street. DOT responded that a public plaza requires less security infrastructure than a shared street due to the design of the spaces. Public plazas only require bollards at each end of the street while shared streets require bollards around each area along the street where pedestrians can congregate.

Mr. Garodnick asked what it would cost to expand the scope of the shared street on East 43rd Street to include thoroughfare improvements along Lexington Avenue two blocks north and south of the intersection of East 43rd Street and Lexington Avenue. DOT estimated that it would cost \$5 million per block. DOT further noted that its analysis found that it would be inefficient to implement less than four blocks of thoroughfare improvements at a given time due to the construction-related traffic disruption, and that a combination of four blocks is where the circulation benefits start to become clear.

Mr. Garodnick asked how the Governing Group would proceed if it wanted to calendar Lexington Avenue thoroughfare improvements in connection with the East 43rd Street shared street. Ms. Lewis explained that the process would be for the Governing Group to request further cost and feasibility analysis to be completed by DOT and OMB.

Mr. Garodnick suggested that the Governing Group vote to calendar and fund Pershing Square East, due to its high priority for both Community Boards, and the security measures for the shared street on East 43rd Street for a combined total of \$21 million. He further proposed that the Governing Group request further information about two to four blocks of thoroughfare improvements along Lexington Avenue in connection with the East 43rd Street shared street.

Mr. O'Neal proposed further cost and feasibility analysis be conducted for Pershing Square East and all thoroughfare improvements along Lexington Avenue. Ms. Lewis cautioned that it would only be advisable to conduct in-depth cost and feasibility analysis for projects that could be funded now since costs estimates would become outdated over time. Ms. Lewis explained funding Pershing Square East and the security measures for East 43rd Street would cost \$21 million, and would not leave enough funding to cover the costs of the entirety of the Lexington Avenue thoroughfare improvements.

The Hon. Ms. Brewer asked when the projects could begin construction. DOT responded that the projects considered have fiscal year 2022 as an approximate start date. DOT noted that the design process takes 18 to 24 months.

Mr. O'Neal asked the City if additional funds were anticipated in the near future from planned development. Mr. Tuttle responded that one project was in the early stages of the land use application process. Mr. Tuttle further explained at what point during the land use application process the contributions would be moved into the Public Realm Improvement Fund.

6. **Vote to Calendar Projects:** Mr. Garodnick made a motion to calendar the public plaza on Pershing Square East and the security measures for the shared street along East 43rd Street. In response to Ms. Chin, Mr. Tuttle clarified that if a project's cost exceed the estimated amount then the project will return to the Governing Group for further discussion and a vote. Upon separate motions made and unanimously carried, resolutions were adopted to calendar the public plaza at Pershing Square East and the security measures for the shared street along East 43rd Street for a funding vote during the current session.
7. **Vote to Fund Projects:** Ms. Lewis announced that two projects were calendared for a funding vote. There were no questions or comments. Upon separate motions made and unanimously carried, resolutions were adopted to fund the public plaza at Pershing Square East and the security measures for the shared street along East 43rd Street, with an estimated cost of \$21.2 million.
8. **New Business:** Mr. Garodnick made a motion to request further information from DOT and OMB on four blocks of thoroughfare improvements along Lexington Avenue running north and south of its intersection with the East 43rd Street shared street. There were no questions or comments. Upon a motion made and unanimously carried, the resolution was adopted.
9. **Adjournment:** There being no further business to come before the meeting, the meeting of the Board of Directors was adjourned at 5:01 p.m.