

DESIGN APPROVAL ONLY:

No work may proceed until the final filing drawings are reviewed, approved and perforated by the Landmarks Preservation Commission staff.



THE NEW YORK CITY LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
1 CENTRE STREET 9TH FLOOR NORTH NEW YORK NY 10007
TEL: 212 669-7700 FAX: 212 669-7780



**PERMIT
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

ISSUE DATE: 05/13/21	EXPIRATION DATE: 5/4/2027	DOCKET #: LPC-21-03235	COFA COFA-21-03235
ADDRESS: 250 WATER STREET		BOROUGH: MANHATTAN	BLOCK/LOT: 98 / 1
South Street Seaport Historic District			

Display This Permit While Work Is In Progress

ISSUED TO:

Saul Scherl
250 Seaport District, LLC
199 Water Street
28th Floor
New York, NY 10038

**NOT ORIGINAL
COMPUTER-GENERATED COPY**

Pursuant to Section 25-307 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, the Landmarks Preservation Commission, at the Public Meeting of at the Public Meeting of May 4, 2021, following the Public Hearing of April 6, 2021, and following the prior Public Meeting of January 13, 2021 and Public Hearing of January 6, 2021, voted to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work at the subject premises, as put forward in your application completed on March 11, 2021.

The proposed work, as approved, consists of the construction of a new full-block building with two-part massing on a vacant lot, consisting of: a three-to-five story base, featuring orange and red toned brick, precast elements, projecting cornices, punched window openings with mullioned metal windows set at varying depths within their openings and balconies with metal railings and planter-boxes at select locations,

Page 1

Issued: 05/13/21

DOCKET #: LPC-21-03235

DESIGN APPROVAL ONLY:

No work may proceed until the final filing drawings are reviewed, approved and perforated by the Landmarks Preservation Commission staff.

prominent lintels and integrated sills in a masonry field, trabeated precast bases with metal storefronts with bulkheads and transom grilles, garage doors and windows; and a multi-story bar tower consisting of four connected volumes of varying heights from 282' 8" to 324' situated at the northwest portion of the block, featuring fluted precast columns and flat lintels and sills with a beige finish, open porches at portions of the facades and mechanical floors, metal windows and doors throughout, and integrated rooftop bulkheads and mechanical equipment at the crown, and with a setback 5th floor and portion of the street façade on Pearl Street featuring similar materials and finishes. The work was shown in a digital presentation labeled "South Street Museum 250 Water Street", dated May 4, 2021, consisting of 108 slides of drawings, photographs and photomontages, prepared by Skidmore Owens and Merrill (SOM). The initial proposal, featuring a base with two towers, was shown in a digital presentation, labeled "South Street Seaport Museum 250 Water Street" dated January 5, 2021 with 247 slides, and "South Street Museum 250 Water Street," dated January 12, 2021 with 281 slides, all prepared by Skidmore Owens Merrill and presented at the Public Hearings and Public Meetings.

In reviewing this proposal, the Commission noted that 250 Water Street is a vacant city block located at the western edge of the South Street Seaport Historic District. The Commission further noted that the South Street Seaport Historic District consists of small scale, four to six-story commercial buildings on small lots, constructed in the mid-19th century, as well as approximately 15 new or reconstructed buildings. The district is surrounded by taller later buildings, some of which were built using an innovative development rights bank created to preserve the district. The Commission finally noted that numerous buildings were demolished to clear most of the 250 Water Street site, and the size and shape of the block was modified for street widenings and extensions on Pearl Street, in the mid-20th century, prior to designation of the historic district; and that the site has been used for parking since at least the 1970s.

Pursuant to Section 25-307 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, the Commission approved the proposal, finding that the South Street Seaport Historic District features a significant number of Commission-approved modern buildings, including those built on lots that were vacant at the time of designation, reconstructions of non-contributing buildings, and large, visible rooftop additions, resulting in a heterogenous composition in which new and old buildings coexist; that the unusually large size of this full-block vacant site on the edge of the district is a unique condition, and therefore the construction of a larger building on the site would not be a precedent for this or other historic districts; that the existing full-block site is currently used as a parking lot and has no historic fabric, and that it does not contribute to an understanding or experience of, and in fact, detracts from, the South Street Seaport Historic District; that in the 19th century this site was densely developed with a variety of independent buildings and no open space, and this proposal will reconstitute the presence of a fully built-out block with varying streetwall heights consistent with the historic condition during the major period of significance of this historic district, and therefore will strengthen and reinforce the site's relationship to the historic district; that the site is located at the western edge of the district, away from the river which was the focus of the historic district, in an area with larger buildings from later periods, such as the contemporary Peck Slip school to the north and the historic former hospital building to the south, and, therefore, can support the presence of a development with a broader and larger footprint and taller street wall than what is found in other areas of the historic district; that the two-part massing of the proposed building will establish a solid, lower-scale base that is relatively simple in form and massing and is consistent with the built volume of many blocks found in the historic district, while the abstracted form of the taller, undulating bar rising from the northwest portion of the site

DESIGN APPROVAL ONLY:

No work may proceed until the final filing drawings are reviewed, approved and perforated by the Landmarks Preservation Commission staff.

will read as an independent form that differentiates itself while being compatible with the base; that the proposed building's three to five-story base is subdivided into smaller modules that relate to the scale of buildings found across Water Street and in the historic district in terms of height and width; that the significant setbacks from the southern and eastern facades to the bar building create and reinforce a strong reading of the base as distinct from the bar building, allowing the base to better relate to the historic buildings on Beekman and Water Streets in terms of height and massing; that the proposed material palette of the base, featuring orange and red toned brick and cast stone elements with light mortar, and painted metal storefronts, garage doors and windows, will relate to the warm-toned masonry and painted metal materials of surrounding historic buildings in terms of color, texture and finish; that the use of punched window openings with prominent lintels and integrated sills in a masonry field and trabeated precast bases with metal storefronts relates to the traditional fenestration, materials and composition of buildings in this historic district; that the base of the building has been articulated with a variety of design elements, including projecting cornices, storefronts with bulkheads and transom grilles, windows with mullions set at varying depths within their openings, and balconies with metal railings and planter-boxes at select locations, to relate to the details and variation found at buildings in the surrounding streetscapes; that the differentiated treatment of a limited portion of the façade on Pearl Street to integrate it physically and visually with the bar building will tie the two-part massing together at a location removed from a historic context while adding architectural interest to the otherwise regular treatment of the façade; that the design and massing of the proposed taller bar building appears narrow from certain vantage points, specifically when viewed from the north and south, and does not call undue attention to itself and away from the historic buildings within the district; that the bar has been situated at the northwestern periphery of the block along the boundary of the historic district, and away from the core of historic buildings further east and adjacent on Water Street, to minimize its visibility from key vantage points within the core of the district, and locate it as far inland as possible from the waterfront of this seaport historic district; that due to the significant setbacks on Beekman and Water Streets, the bar is seen as a tower element primarily in connection with non-historic buildings on Beekman and Pearl Streets and, therefore it will not detract from the exterior architectural elements of the historic buildings in the district; that the design of the bar, including vertically fluted precast columns with a beige finish, a differentiation in proportions of solid to void ratios and restrained palette of the design elements, recalls the materials, details and color of the buildings in the district and brings unity to the overall design while also being distinct from the base; that from many views within the district the historic buildings, as well as this site, are seen with taller buildings rising above and/or behind, and therefore the presence of the proposed bar building, viewed in this context, will not call attention to itself or detract from the exterior architectural features of the buildings within the historic district, nor will it be experienced as disruptive of the scale of the buildings in the historic district; that the 5th floor setback is visible from select locations, functioning as a subordinate, transitional architectural volume, and otherwise provides a clean transition between the base and bar building; that when viewed from Peck Slip within the district looking west, the base and bar building will be seen primarily in context with other modern buildings and therefore will not detract from significant exterior architectural features of the historic buildings; that due to the significant setbacks and the strong reestablishment of the streetwall, the bar building will be read as being disassociated from the base when viewed from Beekman Street looking west, Water Street looking both north and south and Fulton Street looking north, and will not detract from the historic buildings, or call undue attention to the bar building; that looking east from Beekman and Pearl Streets to the East River and Tin Building, the lower streetwall will relate to the historic buildings to the south and east, and due to the significant setback, the bar portion will not detract from the historic buildings; that the new streetwall on

DESIGN APPROVAL ONLY:

No work may proceed until the final filing drawings are reviewed, approved and perforated by the Landmarks Preservation Commission staff.

Pearl Street will complete the built character of the historic district, and the design, fenestration, materials, color and details of the proposed building will reestablish and reinforce the boundary of the historic district, which is now broken and unclear due to the presence of the full city block parking lot; that given the topography, streetplan, change in elevation as the land district slopes east from Pearl Street and the size of the buildings in the district, almost any new building will block views into the historic district from the west, including the 1991 approval, and that because of these factors the bar portion has no material impact on views into the district beyond what the smaller-scale base portion already effects; that the taller streetwall on Pearl Street will not detract from significant exterior architectural features of the historic buildings in the district because it is seen primarily within the context of new and non-historic buildings to the north and south; and that for these reasons the proposed new development will enhance and strengthen the contribution of the site to the historic district, and will not diminish the special architectural and historic character of the South Street Seaport Historic District. Based on these findings, the Commission determined the work to be appropriate and voted to approve it. Therefore, a Design Only Certificate of Appropriateness 21-03235 is being issued.

The Commission notes that this Design Intent Only Certificate of Appropriateness is being issued for work subject to the review of the Department of City Planning. Any changes to the design required by the Department of City Planning approval must be submitted to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for review and approval; and that the final Certificate of Appropriateness will only be issued upon the Commission's review and approval of the final Department of Building filing set of drawings. No work may begin until the final drawings have been marked approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission with a perforated seal.

This permit is issued on the basis of the building and site conditions described in the application and disclosed during the review process. By accepting this permit, the applicant agrees to notify the Commission if the actual building or site conditions vary or if original or historic building fabric is discovered. The Commission reserves the right to amend or revoke this permit, upon written notice to the applicant, in the event that the actual building or site conditions are materially different from those described in the application or disclosed during the review process.

The approved documents, and Department of Buildings filing drawings where applicable, are marked as approved by the Commission, with the date of the approval indicated. The work is limited to what is contained in the approved documents and referenced in the approval. Other work or amendments to this filing must be reviewed and approved separately. The applicant is hereby put on notice that performing or maintaining any work not explicitly authorized by this permit may make the applicant liable for criminal and/or civil penalties, including imprisonment and fine. This letter constitutes the permit; a copy must be prominently displayed at the site while work is in progress. Please direct inquiries to Brian Blazak.

Sarah Carroll
Chair

DESIGN APPROVAL ONLY:

No work may proceed until the final filing drawings are reviewed, approved and perforated by the Landmarks Preservation Commission staff.

PLEASE NOTE: APPROVED DOCUMENTS, DEPARTMENT OF BUIDINGS FILING DRAWINGS WHERE APPLICABLE, AND A COPY OF THIS PERMIT HAVE BEEN PROVIDED TO:

Saul Scherl, 250 Seaport District, LLC

cc: Jared Knowles, Deputy Director; Saul Scherl, 250 Seaport District, LLC